UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

· - - - - - - - - - X

HEATHER GIBSON and

JONATHAN GIBSON, 08-CV-474

1-:-+:44-

Plaintiffs,

US Courthouse

-against- : Central Islip, NY

CROSS SOUND FERRY SERVICES, date

Time ^ a.m. ^ p.m.

591

Defendant. :

TRANSCRIPT OF TRIAL

BEFORE THE HONORABLE LEONARD D. WEXLER UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE, and a jury.

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiff: CELLINO & BARNES

600 Old Country Road, Suite 500 Garden City, New York 11530-2045 BY: GEORGE R. GRIDELLI, ESQ.

For the Defendant: BADIAK & WILL LLP

106 Third Street

Mineola, New York 11501-4404 BY: ALFRED J. WILL, ESQ.

LISA ANN SCOGNAMILLO, ESQ.

Court Reporter: Dominick M. Tursi, CM, CSR

^ Ellen Combs, CSR US District Courthouse 1180 Federal Plaza

Central Islip, New York 11722 (631) 712-6108 Fax: 712-6124

DomTursi@email.com

Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography.
Transcript produced by computer.

592 1 (The following ensued outside the jury at 9:30 2 am.) 3 MR. GRIDELLI: Good morning, your Honor. 4 I'm making a request that, instead of 25 5 minutes, you give me 30 minutes. And the reason being is 6 that I know it is a short number of days but we have had 7 14 witnesses. 8 THE COURT: Denied. 9 MR. GRIDELLI: Thank you. 10 (Recess take.) 11 (The following ensued in the presence of the 12 jury at 9:40 am.) 13 THE COURT: Be seated. 14 As I said yesterday, what we will do now is have 15 the summations by the lawyers. I put time limits on them 16 and I will tell them when they have five minutes left. 17 But remember, what lawyers say is not evidence. 18 It is only what the witnesses have said and the documents. 19 Listen to the lawyers, though. They may be able to put it 20 all together for you. But what they say is not evidence. 21 One of the jurors asked can we take notes. You 22 can but I don't think you need them. I see you don't have 23 a pad or a pencil. 24 A JUJROR: I decided against it. 25 THE COURT: Good. Pay attention.

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

593 1 If you did take notes, I would tell you the 2 notes are only for you. You cannot reveal it to the 3 others because it is your interpretation of what is said. 4 That is why we have a court reporter. 5 With that we will start the opening statements. 6 Again, what lawyers say is not evidence. Plaintiff goes 7 first, defendant goes second, and plaintiff gets a short 8 rebuttal. 9 Plaintiff. 10 MR. GRIDELLI: Thank you, your Honor. 11 SUMMATION FOR PLAINTIFF 12 13 MR. GRIDELLI: Judge Wexler, Mr. Will, 14 Ms. Scognamillo, Heather and Jonathan Gibson, ladies and 15 gentlemen of the jury. 16 I would like to say first thank you very much 17 for your time, your attention, your dedication to your 18 responsibilities as jurors. 19 As you know, during the trial I wasn't allowed 20 to greet you, acknowledge you, have any conversation with 21 you. And that is because those are the rules of the 22 court. I just don't want you to think that I'm a snob or 23 I am rude. I put my head down if I saw you in the hallway 24 and walked right by you. 25 So I apologize for that. That is the one of the

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

rules of the court, and I'm sure Judge Wexler would have hoped I listened to his other rules about speaking objections as well as I did about not interacting with the jurors.

We have a limited time to do these opening remarks. I'm going to use my notes extensively because I am compressed. Normally I like to do more of a conversation type of closing but I can't and I will deal with it as best I can.

At the end of the case, if you want to, you can talk to any of the lawyers. I love to talk to jurors regardless of verdicts because that is how I learn. I get feedback and usually I hope it makes me a better lawyer.

Now I would like to talk about the case.

Number one, did the vessel list or tilt? This is not a case where you have to prove anything beyond a reasonable doubt. The judge told you at the beginning it is a fair preponderance of the evidence. And I ask jurors when we have that type of situation to consider it this way. Think of the scales of justice. On any issue that is in contention, put the evidence that is favorable to me on one side and the evidence that is favorable to the defendant on the other side. If it tips to any degree in my favor, that is a fair preponderance of the credible evidence. To any degree. If it tips to the defendant,

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

595 then I haven't proven my point on that issue. Or actually even if I can't prove it, either. But if it tips to any degree, then I have proven that point. Let's talk about what the defendant can say about the fact that the vessel did not tip. He brought in the three crew members: The engineer, the captain, and Mr. Scott. And they all said nothing happened that night. Now, you probably heard about the term the Blue Wall of Silence. There is a theory that police officers will never testify against each other or never testify and say anything that could hurt another police officer. I don't know if that is true in the seamen industry, in the marine industry, but you know they all came in and they said it didn't happen. I wanted to ask them about: Well, I know you are still employed. I guess all but one are still employed. What do you earn? Because I think it would be important to know. If they are making minimum wage, they probably don't have any loyalty to their employer. But if they are making 50, 100, 300, whatever, that might be some motive for them to maybe side on the favor of the defendant. But we asked those questions; Mr. Will objected. You had Mr. Scott, the defendant's expert. testified that he went out on that boat -- on that vessel;

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

pause.

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

596 I think it is called a boat. I'm learning -- and he tried to steer it in such a way that it would recreate what the plaintiff said occurred. But he made it completely different. He didn't do it when there was a clog in one of the ports. Right? Use your common sense. It is not the same type of test. Remember, I asked him did you put line in there? Because that is what was found. It was so bad for the Sea Jet that night that it couldn't make the return trip. Ιt went out down the river and went back to New London. They had to change ships. She had to go back on a different, slow ferry if you will. So Mr. Scott says: Well, it couldn't happen because I tried to do it. I just hope there were no passengers on that vessel when he tried to do it. And do you really think that if he could have tipped the vessel, he would have? Or do you really think he would have come in and told you that he did? This is a man who has been consulting for over ten years with the defendant's attorneys and testified and comes in. And then remember Mr. Scott. He said the captain would never accelerate quickly. And he said because that would be, and then there was that dramatic

Remember? He was thinking that would be -- and he

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

597 1 waited and waited and waited, and finally he said: That 2 would be bad. Do you remember that? 3 Now, any part of the testimony you can ask the 4 judge if they will read it back to you. And if my 5 recollection is inconsistent with yours, ladies and 6 gentlemen, it is what you remember. Okay? Sometimes I 7 think something is in the case and it is not; because, you 8 look at all those boxes. This is five years of 9 litigation, four and a half years, whatever. So I 10 apologize. It is your recollection that counts. 11 But then I asked him, I said: Mr. Scott, when 12 you were thinking about a word to use, did you ever think 13 of the word negligent? Oh, no. It was bad. 14 So you know now that a captain can do something 15 by accelerating quickly that would make something bad 16 happen to the vessel. He also said something about: 17 Well, it can never veer. It could never tip sharply. 18 "Really. Never?" "No. It could never." 19 And then I showed him the manual here. See. it 20 says it can. Oh, only at high speed. 21 Well, we could argue whether it is just at high 22 speed or not, but he had denied that it could ever do it 23 until I confronted him with that manual. And then it was: Oh, well, at high speed. 24 25 Is that the type of testimony, the quality of

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

598 1 testimony, that you want to base your verdict on? Ι 2 submit that it isn't. Let's look at the evidence to show 3 that there was a listing or a tilting. 4 Heather Gibson testified. I'm not going to go 5 over what she said. You know what she said. Jessica 6 Gibson, her daughter. Stephen Gibson, her son. Nicholas 7 Gibson. I would hope I had more moms on this jury but I 8 don't, because I think any mom would realize you would 9 never bring your kids in to do something to get them 10 involved in a court proceeding and tell them to lie about 11 something. What kind of mother would do that? 12 In this case Heather Gibson didn't. She just 13 had to call her children in and say just tell them what 14 happened. 15 And you know this whole conspiracy theory about 16 the defendant that this was all made up? Please, ladies 17 and gentlemen, if you want to make up a story, just say: 18 I'm on the ship. I stepped out of the booth. There is 19 water, soda. I slip. I fall. I landed on my butt. 20 That's my case. 21 That is so much easier. We don't have to talk 22 about whether the boat can list or not list. We don't 23 have to bring experts in. It is very simple. I slipped 24 and fell on something. It was an unsafe condition. 25 an easy case this would be.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

599 But that isn't what happened. This is what happened. The boat listed, threw the kids off the seat, she had to go try to help her children, as any mother, as any parent would, reach to get them. The boat came slamming down. She hurt herself. So what does she do? Does she tell anyone on the ship I'm hurt? No. She did say to her children I think my spine went into my head. And they make a big thing about it. And you didn't notify anybody on that ship? You didn't notify anybody on that ship? When she came back, she tried to notify somebody. Remember, at Orient Point? And all the offices were closed. So I asked the gentleman there, the chief operator of the whole system: When do the offices close? Back then. Gee, I don't know. Then I asked I think the captain, at least one of the crew When did the offices close? Now, this is members: November, remember. It is winter. So likely they close earlier. But he didn't give us that answer either. Is that believable? It is unbelievable. They don't want you to know. It is consistent with her story that she tried to make a complaint. But what happens? Next day she calls. She speaks to a Mary. Ladies and gentlemen, what is a good indicia of truthfulness is details. Details. She says I spoke to a

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

600 She remembers her name: Mary said call woman. Mary. Speak to William. I called back Sunday. Ι back Sunday. speak to William. He says I'm the wrong guy. Call back Monday and speak to Chris England. She called back Monday. But talking about details, remember the two boys? They said they fell out? Their giggling? They weren't injured. And their food came off the table. Those are details. How Heather said, with the children there: Gee, I felt like my spine went in my head. Well, kids remember that. Those are details. So she calls, leaves a message for Chris England, who I think is the assistant manager or operating officer, I don't remember his title, but you remember he still works for them. I asked Mr. Sise, I asked the captain, does Chris England still work there? Yes, he does. Remember that because that is important. So she goes to the hospital. She tells them what her problem is and they diagnose a fractured coccyx, at Peconic Bay. And later on there is an MRI that says it is not fractured. Fine. Whether it is fractured or not is not the issue. The point is that where did she get this injury? Even their doctor said: Well, there was trauma

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

601 Doesn't that tell us that is what to the coccyx. happened? That is why it was on the boat? That is why the boat did this? We have proof. They have an injury. Are they going to say: Oh, no. This happened two days She rolled out of bed, fell on her buttocks and hurt her back? That is ridiculous. So the injury, itself, proves that something happened that night. What about Captain Thomas? He specifically remembers her being on the ship that night. Wow! Now, remember, she had been taking that ship for about a year-and-a-half almost every other weekend round-trip. That is, what, 70, 80 trips? And if nothing happened that night, why would Captain Thomas remember specifically that she was on the ship that night? You know why? Because something happened. That's why. Otherwise, there would be absolutely no reason for him to be able to specifically remember, on 70 or 80 trips, oh, yes, she was there on that one. What about Jessica Gibson? Her story is consistent with how the boat tilted. But she also said I could tell my mom was hurt, so I didn't go visit my dad. I came back with my mom back to Orient Point. Remember that? That is what she said. I could see my mom was hurt. I didn't want to leave her alone. Even in the defendant's opening statement, he said that

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

602 1 Heather Gibson, in sum and substance, is trying to take 2 advantage of what occurred on the voyage. 3 Take advantage of what? It can't be the 4 backflushing system. The boat is completely calm. 5 lot of the defendants witnesses said it happens quite 6 And she is on the boat 70 or 80 times. So often. 7 obviously it happens quite often. 8 So what event, what incident, is the defendant 9 saying she is trying to take advantage of? Obviously, the 10 fact that the boat listed. 11 But every trial attorney tries to look for that 12 one piece of evidence that we would call the smoking gun, 13 the piece of evidence that is so strong it is going to 14 prove, it is going to win the case for you, it is going to 15 prove the point for you. 16 And in this case we have a smoking gun. And I 17 bet you you know what it is, and if you don't I'm going to 18 tell you what it is. It is the conversation between 19 Heather Gibson and that Chris England. 20 Remember on Monday? He is the third person she 21 talks to. What does Chris England say? I spoke to the 22 crew and know what happened Friday night. I spoke to the 23 crew and I know what happened Friday night. Here's a 24 claim number. And some other stuff. 25 What happened? The crew said nothing happened

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

603 1 to you but they obviously said something happened to Chris 2 That is why he said I know what happened Friday England. 3 night. 4 And remember, as I said, two witness said he 5 still works there. Chris England: Was he in this court 6 today to deny I never said that or I didn't refer to that 7 or I didn't mean that? Why didn't they call him? 8 Mr. Sise and one of the other witnesses said he still 9 works there. Well, maybe he is the one guy that says: 10 You know what? I draw the line at perjury. 11 So now you know the incident happened. How do 12 you feel when the defense produces evidence that basically 13 is trying the pull the wool over your eyes? You know, the 14 defendant could have said: You know what? The incident 15 happened. Let's just argue over the extent of her 16 That would be fair. I would understand that. injuries. 17 But to deny that the incident even happened? No, they 18 just blatantly deny it did. 19 Mr. Will called her an opportunist and then he 20 used some examples. 21 9:38? 48. I have, what, about six more 22 minutes, your Honor? 23 She is an opportunist because she married 24 Jonathan Gibson. Jonathan Gibson was on disability. 25 When I wanted to ask her what did Jonathan knew that.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

604 make before disability, to show you know that it was much, much more than what he made now, who objected again? Al Will, defense attorney. He said in his opening: Oh, and she got her name on the deed. And then I asked Jonathan Gibson: Well, how did that happen? Oh, I asked her to add it. She didn't even want to. I had to pretty much convince her. So why is that being said? Why is Mr. Will trying to paint my client in such a way? He brought out the fact that she filed for bankruptcy. He brought out the fact that she was terminated from two jobs. brought out the fact that she married Mr. Gibson within four months of her divorce. Why is he demeaning her? Why is he degrading her? It is a personal injury case. Let's stay with the facts. He asked her about birth control pills? He has access to her OB-GYN records. Oh, my goodness. You know, the most important thing in any trial is credibility of witnesses. And I submit to you the second most important thing is credibility of the attorneys. And yes, what we say is not evidence but we are allowed to make argument to you. We are allowed to

think the evidence shows. So hopefully I have earned your

sum up the evidence. We are allowed to tell you what we

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

605 1 trust and I ask you to consider whether the other side has 2 earned your trust. 3 THE COURT: You have five minutes left. 4 MR. GRIDELLI: I'm sorry? 5 THE COURT: You have five minutes left. MR. GRIDELLI: Sorry. Then I have to skip quite 6 7 a bit. 8 Remember, I brought in the 0h. Receipts. 9 receipts and I said, the judge said why do you need the 10 receipts? Everyone admitted she was on the ship. 11 That's true. But this is why the receipts were 12 important. If you are injured you don't know if they are 13 going to admit that you were on the boat, you keep the 14 This is proof that something happened. Why does receipt. 15 somebody keep a receipt for years? It is to prove, I 16 don't know, maybe they are going to say I wasn't on the 17 Hey, I have proof. That's why. That is evidence vessel. 18 that something happened. 19 And you remember all the details that they went 20 into about her sexual life between two of them, et cetera, 21 et cetera. 22 When I was reading the depositions, and I wasn't 23 the attorney when it happened, I got the impression of: 24 It's like the rape victim. You know, you accuse 25 somebody of rape and then, boy, they go after you. They

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

606 just try to bury you. They just try to hurt you so that you don't proceed. They try to make that person a victim two times. Don't let Heather Gibson be a victim again. But I think the most important statement from two of the witnesses is this: When we asked Nicholas Gibson what happened and he said I thought the ferry or I thought the boat hit a rock. Remember that? Out of the mouth of babes. I will get a chance to come back to talk more about the injuries, because I'm going to run out of time But the first question on the jury voir dire on this. Were the defendants negligent? Sure. sheet is: caused the boat to list. It wasn't the water. It wasn't the weather. I asked even their own expert: Well, what can it be? It wasn't any outside influence. He said: Well, it is the Loch Ness Monster. Ha-ha! Please use your common sense. You know it had to be how they maneuvered the boat. They did it. They made a mistake. Fine. Let's own up to it. Let's move forward. When you talk about the defendant, remember the defendant in this case is Cross Sound Ferry. But it is a It acts through its individuals. So if the

pilot did something wrong, Cross Sound Ferry did something

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

607 You understand that. We are not going after an individual. It is the company that is responsible for the actions of its employers.

So now she goes, she has a coccyx injury. has herniated disks in her lumbar spine. She starts She treats with Peconic Bay. She treats with treating. Long Island Spine. She treats with New York Orthopedist. She eventually treats with St. Catherine Siena. treats with Dr. Davis. She has epidural injections, just to relieve the pain.

And she says, she admits, yes, it is good for about three or four weeks and then the pain comes back. It is like three injections. Then she has the tingling in her hand. And remember, my expert said look, even my doctor said everything was related to this. It is like hitting the coccyx and everything is right above it, each bone, and it affects it and it goes up the ladder, if you will.

Their expert said no. He said the spinal fusion wasn't related because it is three-and-a-half years ago and said the reason why, the main reason why, was because she didn't complain of anything for ten months. So when cross-examined him I said: Doctor, is that in your opinion the main reason? He said: Yes, the main reason. Then I asked him again, and he said: Well, one of the

Summation for Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

608 1 He is an expert witness. He's testified main reasons. 2 hundreds of times. He knew I was going after him. 3 Then I said: Doctor, instead of ten months how 4 about five months? If the plaintiff came in after five 5 months, would you change your opinion that it wasn't 6 related? No, I wouldn't. 7 How about three months? One month? Whatever I 8 asked: No. 9 He knew I was setting a trap for him. And what 10 did he have to say? To protect his opinion, he said it 11 was only because, I would only agree if the symptoms were 12 one or two days after the incident. 13 One or two days? Heather Gibson didn't even get 14 to the hospital for three-and-a-half days. It means no 15 matter what she had, the doctor would say well, it is more 16 than one or two days. 17 Then we showed you within I think ten days she 18 had marks on her hand; that she has this numbness or this 19 tingling or whatever. And every doctor agreed the nerves 20 coming in and out of the C6/7, which is where the fusion 21 was, affects that part of her body. 22 There it is, ladies and gentlemen, proof that 23 even the initial injury was affecting that part of her 24 spine. 25 So the first question: Was there negligence?

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

	609
1	Clearly.
2	Boat listed? That is a dangerous condition.
3	Two. Was that negligence a proximate cause of
4	the injury? Meaning, would a reasonable person say
5	THE COURT: Your time is up on this first
6	section.
7	MR. GRIDELLI: this is what caused the
8	injury.
9	I will be back to discuss the injuries in a
10	little more detail.
11	Thank you.
12	SUMMATION FOR DEFENSE
13	
14	MR. WILL: Good morning. It is good to be in
15	front of you again.
16	It has been a good trial and I want to thank you
17	for being attentive and listening to the evidence and in
18	watching the videos.
19	And I'm sure you observed Heather refer
20	throughout the trial and you have seen Heather sitting at
21	the witness stand, craning her neck, looking back at the
22	videos as they were being played.
23	A lot of things have been said by the plaintiff
24	but not a lot has been proven. I want to first point out
25	with respect to her allegations in this case.

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

As we said during the trial, she filed a lawsuit almost immediately after the injury. When she filed the lawsuit, she alleged that she was caused to be thrown from her seat.

But then during the course of the litigation she filed papers where she said that the Sea Jet was engaged in a counterclockwise turn. And then she goes on to say the ferry hit a wave that was made by the ferry. She keeps changing the story.

Roy Scott, the marine expert who we had, former Coast Guard inspector, indicated that her story does not comport with the laws of physics because if she had been up when the vessel accelerated going forward, she would have been thrown this way. She wouldn't have been thrown back, she would have gone forward. He made the analogy. It is very clear she would not have gone in any direction but over the table. Her allegations were not supported that there was any incident, by the captain, the crew, or the engineer.

Counsel has brought out that, oh, code of silence. Well, if I hadn't brought the crew members in and I didn't want to bore you with these crew members, what do you think he would have been saying? Where are the crew members? Why weren't they here? But we brought them in.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

611 In addition, we brought in Mr. Jadamec who was the engineer that night who doesn't work for the company. He came in on his own to tell you nothing happened that In his own books, the engine log, there is not one notation of anything unusual. Not one. Nor is there any notation in the vessel's log that anything unusual happened during or after the backflush. Sure, they backflush. It was a common occurrence to get something in a jet. They would stop, they would backflush, and then the captain would proceed. Heather Gibson's testimony on that is just not credible. It is an election year and we hear about flip-flopping. That is what we see here, flip-flopping stories. thrown back. I get thrown out. And then we have the testimony that it was the children who fell out of their Well, who was it when you filed the complaint? Did you fall out of your seat or was it the children? Now, Expert Scott has testified that it is physically and mechanically impossible for sudden acceleration of that vessel. It is a catamaran and it is an inherently stable craft. And during deliberations you will see the pictures that we entered into evidence showing that it is a very large and very stable craft. This is not a vessel which is going to go up and come out of the water. The analogy of the bicycle and the car.

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

It's got dual hulls on either side (sic) which make it extremely stable. It is just not going to happen. It didn't happen because it couldn't happen.

Now, counsel has entered into evidence a page from the operations manual. And again he claims, you know, this is her claim, sudden acceleration. But the operation manual for the Kamewa system clearly states that there is a significant delay between the jet response time and vessel response time.

I mean, this is from the engine manufacturer. There is a delay. So where is sudden engagement? Where is the proof? Where is the proof that anything happened? Other than Heather Gibson, who is looking in this case to collect. This is a stable, properly manned United States Coast Guard vessel. It didn't happen because it couldn't happen.

I want to talk briefly about her medical claims. Here again she changed her story. First of all, it was the coccyx. Well, I injured my coccyx. But when the x-ray, itself, and the MRI film are actually looked at by Dr. Sultan, he said there is no evidence of a fractured coccyx and no evidence that it was ever fractured. There the no evidence of healing.

Dr. Marcus, on the other hand, indicated that it could have been fractured but he never looked at any of

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

613 All he looked at was the report. The evidence the films. is in the film, itself. Sultan reviewed the MRIs. Marcus, who they just hired last month, Dr. Marcus was just brought on board as their hired expert last month. Of course. What do you think he is going to say? He is getting paid \$4,000 to come in here and follow the story But did he look at the films? No. He was given selective records and he said based on my experience and what I think, it is connected. Three and a half years later. I mean, let's be realistic here. She changed her story in connection with her lower back, and when she realized it wasn't a lower back claim she switched gears three-and-a-half years later: Oh, my neck. Now it is my neck. Somehow it migrated from her butt up to her neck three-and-a-half years later. She has surgery. She paid a nontreating physician to come in and give an opinion solely on what she said. In other words, this case resolves around one What she said. There are no witnesses. you credit the children, who testified I would do anything for my mother. I would do anything for my mother. That is the essence of bias. Dr. Marcus also admitted that when he reviewed the records he saw no contemporaneous medical support for

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

614 He reviewed the Peconic records, an injury to her neck. which were a few days later, and he reviewed Long Island Spine. There was nothing to indicate a neck injury. course Dr. Sultan indicated that to have surgery in connection with the neck injury you need a traumatic event that is reported within a matter of a couple of days; a reasonable time. Of course they are talking about the tingling in the fingers and all of this. These little tinglings. But she failed to tell Dr. Marcus that she had shoulder problems and she was complaining of tingling in 2006. They didn't disclose those records to Marcus. Why do you Because he would say: Well, maybe we have a think? problem here. No. They held those records back. But you saw them and we saw them. 2006. Shoulder problems, tingling, weakness in her right side. It is all there. Now, both Dr. Sultan and Dr. Marcus testified that the neck surgery was specifically to resolve arthritic osteophytes. These are things which the doctors testified developed over years. Osteophyte is a degenerative process. And both Dr. Sultan and Marcus testified that the condition, and this is very important, the condition for which she had the surgery, the herniated disks in 2011, didn't exist in 2008. A comparison of the

two MRI reports. And again, Sultan reviewed the MRIs,

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

19

20

21

25

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

615 Marcus didn't, but he agreed with the reports. Не indicated this condition didn't exist. They are trying to pin something on Cross Sound Ferry for a condition that did not exist. Further, Dr. Sultan's review of the operative report points out that the problem was a tear in a ligament, which was where the herniation was. material through the ligament. He said: Look. This condition didn't exist in 2008, and looking at the MRI 10 there is no evidence of healing. This is a new condition. This is a new condition. The herniation is not 12 related to any incident three and a half years later. 13 This was a new condition. They are trying to bootstrap 14 some tingling, for which she had prior issues with her 15 shoulder, into a major surgery that is not related. 16 Further, Dr. Sultan testified that during her 17 examination she was exaggerating her symptoms. 18 resisting, not moving her neck. But when he did different types of tests he was able to tell that she did have the range of motion even though she was trying to phony up the symptoms. 22 Further, he found that her complaints were not 23 based on any dermatol distribution or objective medical 24 finding.

Speaking of medicals and speaking of witnesses

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

616 She was treated by Long Island Spine who don't appear. for this lower back issue for about three years and then she switched over to Dr. Chernoff for another year. Where are they today? How come Dr. Chernoff isn't sitting here to testify and say it is causally related? And where is Dr. Abbasi and Dr. Dowling from Long Island Spine? How come they aren't sitting here? How come they haven't testified to say, yes, in our opinion this condition that she had, the surgery, was related to some incident? They don't want to be involved. So they went out and they hired a hired gun, Dr. Marcus, a few weeks ago. Just got his report a few weeks ago. Oh, now we have Marcus. Who is he? Well, they didn't want to testify, their doctors did not want to testify, so they went out and they brought Marcus. MR. GRIDELLI: Objection, your Honor. Side bar. THE COURT: Overruled. What lawyers say is not evidence, therefore it doesn't matter. Go ahead. MR. WILL: Now, Heather Gibson admitted that she didn't report this so-called trip to any crew member that That night, over and back. Or on the return trip. night. Nor on Sunday night. But don't you think that if she hurt her back

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

617 and her kids fell out and her daughter, her daughter said mom, I'm going to come back with you on the night trip because you are telling me you hurt, don't you think that when she was hurt on that trip they would hunt down a crew member and say we've got a problem here? I hurt myself? Didn't happen. It didn't happen. Why didn't she tell the night watchman at Orient Why didn't she tell Captain Thomas when he was Point? walking the deck and he saw her? Now, counsel made a point of saying, oh, Captain Thomas remembered speaking to her. Yes, Captain Thomas remembers because she went and asked about the return They had a few conversations. And she had ample trip. opportunity to say: You know something? My kids fell down. I jammed my spine. I hurt myself. Didn't happen. This whole event didn't happen because it couldn't happen. Mechanically. It is a question of her credibility. There she is. She is here, making a claim. Nor did she seek any medical attention Friday If her back was hurting her so much with her daughter, why didn't she go to the emergency room? She didn't. Not Friday night. Not Saturday night. Sunday. As I said in my opening, this is an

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

618 And her attempt to implicate and identify afterthought. this former US Marine, Jeremy Barboza, as someone who heard the commotion, that was really embarrassing. mean, this guy is only 5-8. He has never worn eye glasses. Has a shaved head. And he has a distinctive beard. She described him as 5-10, crewcut, glasses. Ι mean, it was an embarrassment. An embarrassment for him and an embarrassment for us. So I'm asking you, do you think that an incident that she is claiming of that particular magnitude, if she is claiming the vessel went up and slammed down and no other passenger was affected, nobody else spilled their coffee or no one else dropped something or fell, just her, it just happened to her, isn't that funny? Just happened to Heather and her family on the second deck. Sure, there were other passengers. The records show there were more than just Heather and her family. But no one complained. It didn't happen because it couldn't happen. The vessel physically does not do what they claim it did. And it is not capable of sudden acceleration. Now let's talk about the announcement. First of all, when the vessel left port there was a Moderate Sea

Announcement advising passengers to remain seated.

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

619 1 Let's use our heads here. are on the water. Right? 2 Captain Thomas made three backflushing 3 announcements, three within the space of 10 minutes, 4 saying we are slowing the vessel down. We are going to 5 clear a clog and we will be back up to speed shortly. Their own expert, Clifford, testified that he 6 7 was aware that three backflushing announcements were made 8 in ten minutes. And these announcements advise passengers 9 of impending movement and that the vessel is going to be 10 moving shortly, back up to speed shortly. Those were his 11 words. That is where their expert, he admitted that. 12 Roy Scott, the Coast Guard investigator, said 13 the captain made three announcements in 10 minutes. 14 is certainly reasonable care. Right? What more are you 15 supposed to do? Walk around the ship and tell everybody? 16 To hold their hands? The bottoms line is, the three 17 announcements were made within ten minutes. And everybody 18 knew the ship was going to be moving. And moving slowly. 19 The judge is going to tell you that in order to 20 find any negligence on the part of my client, you have to 21 find both a foreseeable danger of injury and conduct which 22 is unreasonable in proportion to the danger. Two things 23 you have to find. 24 Now, you have heard the operations manager, Dick 25 Sise, say it has never been reported to him that the

Summation for Defense/Mr. Will

	620
1	vessel has suddenly engaged, gone up out of the water, and
2	slammed down. Right? So there was no foreseeable danger.
3	There was nothing that they said: Oh, well, we have had
4	this problem before so we have got to be aware of it.
5	There is no notice of any type of a condition.
6	And, secondly, there was no foreseeable danger
7	given that Clifford's testimony was that these
8	announcements were made, three within ten minutes.
9	Neither of the conditions are satisfied and there can be
10	no finding of anything improper by Cross Sound. Even
11	assuming, even assuming for the stretch of the
12	imagination, anything occurred, there was no foreseeable
13	danger.
14	(Continued on the following page.)
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation - Defense/Mr. Will

621 MR. WILL: Now let's talk about bias. And again he talks about the blue code of silence. But the real bias, as I indicated earlier is seeing with Ms. Gibson's children who testified at their position at a trial. I would do anything for my mother. I mean let's face it, they're kids. And they were taken, and we've established, and the evidence shows that they were coached and rehearsed. Not only by her, by Mr. Gridelli. The words slammed down, the word backflushing. Again, what the funny thing is, in that announcement, the backflushing announcement, they say, we're going to flush the clog out. They don't use the word backflushing. It's not used. You will see the announcement. So where did they get the word backflushing from? Answer: Coaching. All right, let's go over the words; slam down, backflushing. In fact Nicholas testified that it was Mr. Gridelli who said, Did the boat go up and down, turn and slam down? Is that a leading question or a piped in answer, if I have heard it. And you know, I find it amazing that Nicholas, who was five at the time couldn't remember some simple details. But he could remember that his mother said, Hum, felt like her spine went right through her head. Wow, he remembered that. It's like right on cue. It's like we

Summation - Defense/Mr. Will

622 1 all sat in on that meeting. 2 Okay, what are you going to say? Oh, slam down 3 backflushing, oh it went right through her spine. 4 that convenient? Right? Let's just tie-in right up the 5 chain right to her head. Come on. 6 It's a disgrace. Quite frankly I was 7 uncomfortable questioning the kid. I have four kids of my 8 Maybe I don't look like I have four kids, but I do. own. 9 THE COURT: We're not interested in your family. 10 Continue. 11 MR. WILL: Thank you, your Honor. 12 I was very uncomfortable questioning the kids, 13 but I didn't put her up. I didn't put these kids up there 14 and subject them to the scrutiny, she did. Again, she's 15 the plaintiff. No, this was unwitnessed unless you 16 believe these coached children. They sat there and they 17 skipped and hesitated on questions and other details. But 18 yet on certain words, bing, they came right in on cue. 19 Let's just talk a second about the loss of 20 services claimed by Jonathan over there. The evidence has 21 shown that they can and still do everything that they used 22 to do together. Four years since this. Four vacations; 23 Florida for ten days, Disney World walking around, 24 Universal. Jersey shore. They had old boats. They have 25 new boats. They go out for hours at a time on the boats.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation - Defense/Mr. Will

623 They go fishing. They go shopping together. They go out to eat. She cooks for him. She cleans for him. They go to the kids' games. Nothing has changed. Life goes on as Nothing has changed. There was no interruption in their lives, and that is proven by the videos. And even to this day, she sits there and said I'm almost at a hundred percent. Now let's talk a minute about the videos. You saw the videos of Heather Gibson in December of 2007. And this incident happened when? In November. Wow, she's out and about, going shopping, going to the donut store, going to videotapes. That was in December. And in January of 2008, a couple of months later, no interruption. I mean she is walking around business as usual. And in February of 2008, selling and walking those dogs, carrying those dogs. She may say, well I had a back injection. Well that back injection wasn't until April of 2008, well after these videos were taken. Now --THE COURT: You have five minutes left. MR. WILL: Thank you, your Honor. Now what did we see in the videos? We've seen her bending. Oh, but at the deposition, it's too painful to bend. And what do we see her doing? Oh, she's at the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Summation - Defense/Mr. Will

624 basketball game, squatting for what, a minute and-a-half, squatting on the balls of her feet for a minute and-a-half, bouncing a basketball. I mean, come on. And we've got the video of her being pulled around by this massive, massive Saint Bernard. I mean is that a woman who has a disability? And of course, the dog loving photo. Yes, carrying that, and holding that dog for an unlimited amount of time, this big Saint Bernard puppy squirming in her hands. Look at the smile on her face. Is she grimacing? Does she look like she's in pain? Of course not, absolutely not. There was no interruption of what they did; bending, running, squatting, carrying the dog. You've seen the videos of her. She said, Oh, I can't get in my car. I can't get out of my car. I can't move easily, everything is stiff. You saw the videos, moving fluidly. You saw her turning her head, like I said in the beginning, like an owl. I mean there she was, pulling out of that parking spot, this way, and that way, this way, nothing wrong with her neck. Come on. And this was shortly after the incident. Three and-a-half years later, oh, geeze, I need surgery. Members of the jury, how can you not be

Rebuttal Summation - Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

625 1 persuaded by the videos? How could you not be persuaded 2 by the videos? You've seen them. 3 The evidence is there. Cross Sound Ferry didn't 4 do anything wrong. It didn't happen because it couldn't 5 You're savvy New Yorkers, all of you. And savvy 6 New Yorkers are not fooled. They're not fooled. 7 And I'm asking you to return a verdict for the 8 defendant. 9 Thank you very much. 10 11 REBUTTAL SUMMATION - PLAINTIFF/Mr. Gridelli 12 MR. GRIDELLI: Ladies and gentlemen, I only have 13 five minutes. This is going to be quick. 14 Remember I said credibility of attorneys, how 15 important that is when they argue something? 16 Where in this case is there any evidence that 17 the doctors who treated her didn't want to testify, didn't 18 want to come in and testify? Point now, I'll go sit down 19 and say they win. Point out any evidence in this case 20 that he said the doctors refused to testify, didn't want 21 to get involved. Credibility of attorneys when they tell 22 you something. 23 He said no one else spilled coffee on the ship. 24 No one else was injured. Is there any testimony in this 25 case about that? Any testimony? Other than Mr. Will

Rebuttal Summation - Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

telling you that. Credibility when an attorney tells you something, I hope you should be able to rely on it.

And the complaint says she was thrown from her seat. Have you dealt with attorneys? Did you ever do a contract, or buy a house, or sell a house? Did you read the contract, or does the attorney say just, sign here. Maybe other than your will, I would think you would read, most attorneys don't. And maybe that is why Mr. Mulvehill who drafted the complaint is no longer her attorney.

The announcement. We know from Scott's only testimony that the boat can, remember accelerate quickly, a very bad thing can happen. So we know. You know, and he said it. That's his expert. A very bad thing can happen. So there should be an announcement: Ladies and gentlemen we're about to proceed now. We finished the backflush. Okay? Something could happen where the boat could tilt or list. Please remain seated, just secure yourself. That's the only announcement we need, and nothing would have happened.

I got to get to the medicals.

Both experts said she had a degenerative disc condition, and that many, many people have that. But she was asymptomatic. That means she had no symptoms. She was symptom free.

Now the trauma comes and it produces pain. She

Rebuttal Summation - Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

627 1 goes from a symptom-free condition to a painful condition. 2 So, and listen to the judge's charge. If they 3 cause an injury like a herniated disc, they're 4 responsible. If they create a condition or exacerbate a 5 previous condition, exacerbate a previous condition -- in 6 this case the degenerative disc disease -- they're 7 responsible. She was sympton free. Her whole life, she 8 was 36, never had a problem. And now for four and-a-half 9 years she has been treating with doctors and had to have 10 surgery. 11 Quickly, let's talk about the video, 12 surveillance video, 12 days, 13 days. Yes, they have her 13 walking. Yes, they have her squatting. Yes, they have 14 her bending in the car. Yes, they have her holding coffee 15 and doughnuts. Where is the video of her playing soccer 16 with her daughter? Where's the video of her walking the 17 three miles? Where is the video of her doing any type of 18 athletic activity at this time? Where is the video of her 19 playing with her kids? Where is the video of her shell 20 fishing, fishing, or doing any type of athletic activity? 21 They got her walking around. We never said she was 22 crippled. We never said that she was paralyzed. What did 23 she say? Yes, I could squat down. The pain is when I get 24 back up. 25 The hardest thing for a plaintiff's trial

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

25

Rebuttal Summation - Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

628 attorney is to get a jury to, to appreciate the injuries of a client. And I have to take some of these expert quotes. Aristotle said: The aim of the wise is to avoid pain and secure pleasure. Stephen King: There is no tyrant as merciless as pain. Saint Augustine: The greatest evil is physical pain. Julius Caesar: It is easier to find a man who will volunteer to die, than to find those who are willing 12 to endure pain with patience. 13 And my favorite George Orwell. Of pain you 14 could wish only one thing, that it should stop. Nothing in the world is so bad as physical pain. It is the face of pain -- In the face of pain there are no heroes. You're going to be asked to award damages if you find the defendant was negligent and caused her injuries or exacerbated her injuries. And if you award it -- and it says on the jury verdict sheet past damages. That means pain and suffering, because there is no lost wages 22 claimed here. She was just starting a business. 23 couldn't prove what she was going to earn. We were trying 24 to be credible to you. Past pain and suffering, four and-a-half years.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Rebuttal Summation - Plaintiff/Mr. Gridelli

629 You know the whole story; treated, injections, surgery. I submit to you that if you came back with a verdict of \$10 million dollars, that would be excessive. But if you came back with a verdict of \$1 million dollars for past pain and suffering, I submit to you that would be inadequate. Let's talk about future pain and suffering. She There is a life expectancy of 35.3 years. judge will tell you that we use that actuary table because we don't know how long people are going to live. That is the fairest way. 12 THE COURT: You have one minute left. 13 MR. GRIDELLI: How much do you award somebody 14 for 35.3 years of her life is changed. Remember Jonathan Gibson said she is about 70 percent of what she was. I submit to you that if you awarded \$5 million dollars for the next 35 years, that would be excessive. But if you awarded less than a million, that would be inadequate. And ladies and gentlemen, remember if you award something that justice says is 90 percent less or 90 percent of what you should, you're not giving 90 percent 23 of justice, you're giving the ten percent of injustice. With Jonathan Gibson, I believe his past loss of 24 25 services claim -- remember they were just starting their

630 1 life. They were married. This was their honeymoon time 2 for the first couple of years. And boom, this happened. 3 \$250,000 would be reasonable, I submit to you for past 4 loss of services. Future loss of services, \$300,000 for 5 the next 35 years. Thank you very much. 6 7 THE COURT: Why don't we take a five minute I will take about 15 minutes. So don't talk about 8 break. 9 the case. Five minutes. 10 (A recess was taken at 10:28 a.m.) 11 (After recess the following occurred.) 12 13 THE COURT'S CHARGE 14 THE COURT: Now that the evidence in the case 15 has been presented and the attorneys for the parties have 16 concluded their closing arguments, it's my responsibility 17 to instruct you as to the law that governs this case. My 18 instructions will be in three parts. 19 First, I'll give you instructions regarding the 20 general rules that define and govern the duties of a jury 21 in a civil case. 22 Second, I will instruct you as to the legal 23 elements of the cause of action relative to this case. 24 And third and finally some general rules 25 defining your deliberations as jurors.

COURT'S CHARGE

It is your responsibility and duty to find the facts from all the evidence in this case. You are the sole judges of the facts, not counsel and not myself. I want to impress upon you again the importance of that role. It is for you and you alone to pass on the weight of the evidence, and resolve such conflicts as may have appeared in the evidence, and to draw such inferences as you deem to be reasonable and warranted from the evidence or the lack of evidence.

With respect to any question concerning the facts, it is your recollection of the evidence, and yours alone that controls.

Parties are equal before the court. This case should be considered and decided by you as an action between parties of equal standing in the community. All persons, corporations and entities stand equal before the law and are to be dealt with as equals in this court. All parties are entitled to equal consideration. No party is entitled to sympathy or favor. You must judge the facts and apply the law as I shall instruct you without bias prejudice or sympathy either for the plaintiffs or the defendants.

Burden of proof. In a civil case such as this the plaintiff has the burden of proving the essential elements of their claims against the defendant by a

COURT'S CHARGE

preponderance of the evidence. To establish a claim by the preponderance of the evidence, means simply to prove that something is more likely. A preponderance of the evidence means the greater part of the evidence. It does not mean the greater number of witnesses, or the greater length of time taken by either side.

The phrase preponderance of the evidence refers to the quality of the evidence, the weight and effect it has on your minds.

If the plaintiffs are to win, the evidence that supports their claim must appeal to you as more nearly representing what took place, than the evidence opposed to their claim. To put it differently, if you put plaintiffs and defendants evidence on opposite sides of a scale, the plaintiff would have to make the scales tip slightly in their favor.

If the evidence weighs so evenly that you are unable to say there is a preponderance on either side, then you must resolve it in the defendant's favor. To recapitulate briefly; the preponderance of the evidence means such evidence as when you considered and compared with that opposed to it, produces in your mind that the belief of what is sought to be proved is more likely the case than not the case.

Now the evidence upon which you are to decide

COURT'S CHARGE

what the facts are comes in several forms; sworn testimony of witnesses both on direct and cross-examination, and regardless who has called them; exhibits the court received in evidence; and facts to which the lawyers have agreed or stipulated.

Certain things are not evidence, and are to be disregarded in deciding what the facts are. Again, arguments or statements by lawyers are not evidence.

Objections to questions you don't consider. And testimony that has been excluded or stricken, is irrelevant, disregard it. And anything you may have seen or heard outside the courtroom is not evidence.

In deciding what the facts are you must consider all the evidence that has been offered. In doing this you must decide which testimony to believe, and which testimony not to believe. In making that decision there are a number of factors you may take into account, including the following:

The witness's opportunity to observe the events he or she described; the witness's intelligence and memory; the witness's manner while testifying. Does the witness have an interest in the outcome of the case? Does the witness have any bias or prejudice concerning any part of the matter involved in this case? The reasonableness of the witness' testimony considered in light of all the

evidence in the case.

apply to any other witness.

In considering the testimony of the plaintiffs or the defendant you must apply the same standards as you

If you find that a witness's testimony is contradicted by what that witness has said or done at another time, or the testimony of other witnesses, you may disbelieve all or any part of the witness' testimony. But in deciding whether or not to believe the witness, keep this in mind. People sometimes forget things. A contradiction may be an innocent lapse of memory, or it may be an intentional falsehood. Consider therefore, whether it has to do with an important fact, or only a small detail. Different people who remember the same event, may remember it differently, and therefore testify about it differently.

You may consider these factors in deciding how much weight to give to the testimony. You are not to give any greater weight or credence to a witness solely because of his title or position.

Now ordinarily opinions of witnesses are not received in evidence. However, opinions of expert witnesses qualified by training and experience in a particular field of specialized learning are received in evidence. And the expert witness is committed and

635 1 expected to give you the reasons for, and the basis of his 2 or her opinion. 3 You should weigh and evaluate the testimony of 4 an expert witness precisely as you weigh the testimony of 5 any other witness. 6 We now go to the law portion of the case. 7 Law portion. This case is brought by the 8 plaintiffs, Heather Gibson and her husband Jonathan Gibson 9 against defendant Cross Sound Ferry Service, Inc., who I 10 shall refer to as the defendant. 11 As a corporation, Cross Sound Ferry Services 12 acts only through its employees. When I refer to the 13 defendant in this case, I am referring to Cross Sound 14 Ferry Services, Inc and its employees. 15 Defendant owns and operates a ferry known as the 16 Sea Jet that runs between Orient Point, New York, and New 17 London, Connecticut, which I will refer to as the ferry. 18 Plaintiff Heather Gibson alleges that she 19 suffered personal injuries as a result of defendant's 20 negligence while she was a passenger on the ferry. 21 Plaintiff Jonathan Gibson seeks damages due to 22 the loss of his wife's services. Defendant denies all of 23 plaintiffs' claims. 24 You will first determine whether defendant's 25 negligence was the legal cause of plaintiff Heather

Gibson's injury. If, and only if the defendant is found to have been negligent, will you determine the claim of Jonathan Gibson for the loss of the wife's services, as I will explain that claim to you.

For Heather Gibson to prevail on her claim of negligence, she must prove the following three elements by a preponderance of the evidence.

- 1. Negligence of the defendant.
- 2. Proximate cause.
- 3. Damages.

The burden of proof as to the defendant's negligence is on the plaintiff. If she fails to sustain her burden you will find for the defendant.

I will now further explain plaintiffs' claims and provide you with further definitions and instructions.

Negligence defined. Negligence is the lack of ordinary care. It's the failure to use that degree of care that a reasonable, prudent person would have used under the same circumstances. Negligence may arise from doing an act that a reasonable, prudent person would not have done under the same circumstances. Or on the other hand, from failing to do an act that a reasonable, prudent person would have done under the same circumstances.

In this case defendant owed a duty of reasonable care to act for the safety of its passengers. Heather

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COURT'S CHARGE

637 Gibson's claim of negligence is that defendant failed to exercise such reasonable care in the operation of the ferry. Reasonable care means that degree of care that a reasonable, prudent ship owner would use under the same circumstances, taking into account the foreseeable risk of injury. A ship owner is not an insurer of passenger Instead there must be some failure to exercise safety. reasonable care before liability may be imposed. Because starting, slowing or stopping may not always be done smoothly, and occasionally there may be The ferry operator is not liable for some jolting. passengers' -- injuries to a passenger when that happens. The operator of a ferry must, however, avoid sudden, unusual and violent jerks, lurks or stops. If you find that the movement of the ferry was sudden, unusual and violent, then you will find that defendant was negligent. If, however, you find that a stop or movement was not sudden, unusual or violent, you will find that the defendant was not negligent. Ultimately you will decide whether defendant acted reasonably under the totality of the circumstances. Proximate cause. I think I'm skipping a page. Foreseeable defined. Negligence requires a

COURT'S CHARGE

reasonable foreseeable danger of injury to another, and conduct that is unreasonable in proportion to that danger.

A ship owner is only responsible for the results of his conduct if the risk of injury is reasonably foreseeable. The exact occurrence or exact injuries does not have to be foreseeable. But injury as a result of negligent conduct must be not merely possible, but probable. There is negligence if a reasonable, prudent ship owner could foresee injury as a result of his conduct, and acted unreasonably in light of what he could foresee.

On the other hand, there is no negligence if a reasonably prudent ship owner could not have foreseen any injury as a result of his conduct, or acted reasonably in light of what he could have foreseen.

Proximate cause. In all causes of action the wrong or fault must have been a proximate cause of the injury. I will define proximate cause. And act or omission is a proximate cause of an injury, if it was a substantial factor in bringing about the injury. That is, if it had such an effect in producing the injury that a reasonable person would regard it as the cause of the injury.

Damages. If you find that plaintiff is liable for the injuries suffered by Heather Gibson, then you must

COURT'S CHARGE

determine the amount of damages that she is entitled to recover. My charges to you on the law of damages must not be taken as a suggestion that you should find for Heather Gibson. It is for you to decide from the evidence presented and the rules of law that I have given you, whether she is entitled to recover from defendants.

If you decide that she is not entitled to recover, you go no further in considering damages. Only if you decide that Heather Gibson is entitled to recover, will you consider the measure of damages.

If you decide that Heather Gibson is entitled to a verdict, any award of damages must be reasonable. You may award her only such damages as would reasonably compensate her for past and future conscious pain and suffering. In assessing damages you will have to take into account any injury which you find was caused by the defendant's negligence.

If you find that Heather Gibson had a preexisting medical condition, and that as a result of the negligence of the defendant this preexisting condition was aggravated, you shall award damages for the aggravation of the preexisting condition. But you should not award any damages for the preexisting condition itself.

Conscious pain and suffering means pain and suffering of which there was some level awareness by the

COURT'S CHARGE

640

plaintiff. Pain and suffering includes loss of enjoyment of life. Loss of enjoyment of life involves a loss of the ability to perform daily functions, to participate in activities which were part of life before the injuries.

You are not permitted to award speculative damages.

Permanency of injuries; life expectancy. To the extent that you determine that any of Heather Gibson's injuries are permanent, she is entitled to recover for future damages. In this regard you will consider her age

extent that you determine that any of Heather Gibson's injuries are permanent, she is entitled to recover for future damages. In this regard you will consider her age and life expectancy. Evidence of life expectancy is found in the life expectancy tables. Heather Gibson has a remaining life expectancy of 35.3 years. Life expectancy tables provide nothing more than a statistical average. A person may live longer or die sooner than the time indicated by those tables.

Loss of services. Jonathan Gibson, plaintiff Heather Gibson's husband has a separate claim in this lawsuit. His claim is for the loss of services of his wife. This claim will be considered by you only if you find for Heather Gibson, and find there was negligence.

If you find that Jonathan Gibson is entitled to recover, you will award him damages for the pecuniary loss which you found he sustained by the loss of his wife's services and society.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COURT'S CHARGE

641 Although sometimes this is referred to as loss of society, not only services, but also such elements as love, companionship, affection, society and sexual relations. You will award Jonathan Gibson such an amount based upon the evidence, based on your own observations, experience and knowledge, conscientiously applied to the facts and circumstances as in your judgment will compensate Jonathan Gibson for the pecuniary loss you find he has sustained, and is reasonably certain to sustain in the future by reason of his wife's inability to perform such services and provide society as a result of her injuries. We now come to the conclusion, which is very brief. I remind you once again that it is your responsibility to judge the facts in this case from all the evidence submitted during the trial, and to apply the law as I have just given it to you. Your deliberations should include a rational discussion of the evidence in this case by all of you. Ιn other words, I am now saying, discuss the case amongst yourselves. In your deliberations you're entitled to your own opinion, but you should exchange views with your fellow jurors, and listen carefully to each other. While

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COURT'S CHARGE

642 you should not hesitate to change your opinion if you are convinced that another opinion is correct, your decision must be your own. If you wish to have some of the testimony repeated, you may make such a request. I'll call you into court, and have the reporter read those portions that you desire to hear. If you wish to hear some portions of these instructions repeated, make that same request. Either can be accomplished by giving a note to the clerk, to Joe. If it becomes necessary during your deliberations to communicate with me for any reason, send me a note through Joe. No communication, except by a writing, which is the note. The court will not communicate with any member on the jury on any subject touching on the merits of the case, other than by writing or orally in open court. By that I mean sometimes you'll send in a note, and I can answer it by just writing on the note itself. Sometimes we can't. Sometimes you want to hear the testimony. Sometimes you want to hear the flavor of the testimony. So assuming this was an accident case, and you wrote, asked through your note, What was, what did witness A say the color of the light was?

Any note you send me has to go to the lawyers.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COURT'S CHARGE

643 If they agree and I agree with hit, we'll They read it. put red on it and send it right back. Sometimes you want to hear the flavor of what a particular witness started out to say, or something like So you ask for that witness. We will play that testimony. When you all are satisfied you have heard enough, stop the reading. You don't have to go back to continue with the reading. You don't have to listen to cross-examination. You don't have to read the redirect, or anything like that. If you are all satisfied, stop the reading. You're not penalized because you asked for a particular thing. But it has to be unanimous. Anything you do as a jury has to be unanimous. I know when you know when you've heard enough. I can see your heads looking at each other and saying; did we hear enough? And everyone is saying; yeah. And I'll ask you, do you all agree you heard enough? And if you say enough, I send you back. There is another rule. You're not supposed to tell me where you stand. You can't say it's six to one, four to three, or anything like that. Not that I'm not supposed to know. Remember I said anything you send me I

have to give to the lawyers. They're not supposed to

	044
1	know.
2	So don't, if you send me a note, don't tell me
3	how you stand numerically, unless you all unanimously
4	agree on the verdict.
5	Again, I will repeat, any verdict you reach must
6	be unanimous. Your oath sums up your duty that you will
7	without fear or favor to any persons conscientiously and
8	truly try the issues before you according to the evidence
9	given to you in open court.
10	Now as you notice, I have read my charge to you.
11	I now have a sidebar with the lawyers to see, did I miss a
12	page, or miss a paragraph, or did I say something wrong.
13	So lawyers, sidebar.
14	(The following occurred at sidebar.)
15	THE COURT: Did I read it correctly?
16	MR. GRIDELLI: If you find that plaintiff is
17	liable. It should be defendant.
18	(The following occurred in open court.)
19	THE COURT: Okay. I read it wrong, they tell
20	me. At the beginning I said, If you find that defendant
21	is liable. That is what I should have said.
22	They said I said, If you find plaintiff is
23	liable. Obviously that is wrong, and I correct it.
24	MR. GRIDELLI: Thank you, your Honor.
25	THE COURT: Now let me tell you what is going to

645 1 happen. 2 I told you not to make notes of my summation --3 I mean my charge to you on the law. There is a reason. 4 I'm sending you in what I read, the law portion only. So 5 everyone of you is going to get a copy of it. So if there 6 is something you missed, or you want to see what I said, 7 you're going to have a copy. That's why. 8 We will now have the lawyers get all of the 9 exhibits together. Anything that is marked in evidence, 10 and I always say in evidence, and it gets boring after a 11 while. Why am I saying it? Because if there is a dispute 12 we go to the record and we see what the evidence is. 13 My statement was *in evidence*. If it is not my 14 statement, it doesn't come in. You will get everything 15 that is marked in evidence. 16 The first thing you have to do is find a 17 foreperson. Do that quickly. That person doesn't get 18 more money, doesn't get two votes. They only have one 19 vote. They can't change the vote. But that person will 20 be in charge, because I'm going to send in, as I said, the 21 law portion. 22 I'm going to send in -- I'm going to send in the verdict sheet. And if you follow the verdict sheet it 23 24 will help. And the foreperson, whoever he or she is will

see that if you follow the verdict sheet it will tell you;

25

1	646 Point 1, go to 2, go to 3. So if you follow that it will
2	go much easier for you.
3	I think I covered everything. I think I can
4	send you out. Oh, lunch you'll have at twelve o'clock.
5	Start your deliberations. You will get the
6	charge that I gave you on the law, and we'll get together
7	all of the evidence.
8	THE CLERK: Did they review it, judge, and the
9	verdict sheet?
10	THE COURT: Yes.
11	You all agree that the verdict sheet has been
12	examined by all of you?
13	MR. GRIDELLI: Yes, your Honor.
14	THE COURT: So the law and the verdict sheet and
15	the evidence come in.
16	Good luck.
17	(The jury left the courtroom at 11:00 a.m. to
18	begin deliberations.)
19	THE COURT: Now make sure what is in evidence
20	goes in, and not something else. Have you gone offer it?
21	MR. GRIDELLI: Not together, your Honor.
22	THE COURT: Well, it would help if you do it
23	together.
24	MR. GRIDELLI: Yes, right. We'll do it now.
25	THE CLERK: Court Exhibit Number 1, letter dated

```
647
 1
      November 17, 2011.
                Court Exhibit 2, a letter dated November 18,
 2
      2011.
 3
 4
                Court Exhibit 3 is a verdict sheet.
 5
                Court Exhibit 4 is the charge.
                (A recess was taken at 11:00 a.m.)
 6
                 (Continued on the following page.)
 7
 8
                 (The following ensued in the presence of the
 9
      jury at 12:20 pm.)
10
11
                                VERDICT
12
                THE COURT:
                            We have a note from the jury, marked
13
      Court Exhibit No. 5: "Your Honor, we have reached a
14
      verdict."
                I will have the clerk take the verdict.
15
16
                THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Yes, judge.
17
                Madam forelady, please rise.
18
                Has the jury reached a verdict? Yes or no?
19
                THE FOREPERSON: Yes.
20
                THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Please refer to the
21
      verdict sheet.
22
                Question No. 1. Was the defendant negligent?
23
                Yes or no?
24
                THE FOREPERSON:
                                  No.
25
                THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Be seated, please.
```

	648
1	THE COURT: Poll the jury.
2	THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Ladies and gentlemen, as
3	the court has received your verdict, you say you find in
4	favor of the defendant and against the plaintiffs.
5	Juror No. 1, is that your verdict?
6	JUROR NO. 1: Yes.
7	THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Juror No. 2, is that your
8	verdict?
9	JUROR NO. 2: Yes.
10	THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Juror No. 3, is that your
11	verdict?
12	JUROR NO. 3: Yes.
13	THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Juror No. 4, is that your
14	verdict?
15	JUROR NO. 4: Yes.
16	THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Juror No. 5, is that your
17	verdict?
18	JUROR NO. 5: Yes.
19	THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Juror No. 6, is that your
20	verdict?
21	JUROR NO. 6: Yes.
22	THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Juror No. 7, is that your
23	verdict?
24	JUROR NO. 7: Yes.
25	THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: And so say you all?

	649
1	THE JURY: Yes.
2	THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Jury polled, judge.
3	THE COURT: The jury is excused with the thanks
4	of to he court.
5	I will come in and talk with you. I understand
6	your lunch is here. I will come in and talk to you.
7	You are discharged.
8	(The following ensued in the absence of the
9	jury.)
10	THE COURT: Any motions?
11	MR. GRIDELLI: Yes, your Honor.
12	Most respectfully, I would move tos et aside the
13	verdict as against the weight of the evidence in this
14	case.
15	THE COURT: Denied.
16	Thank you. I will talk to the jury. They are
17	going to have their lunch and they are free to leave.
18	(Proceedings adjourned at 12:25 pm.)
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

			650
1	INDEX		
2			
3	SUMMATION FOR PLAINTIFF	593	
4	SUMMATION FOR DEFENSE	609	
5	REBUTTAL SUMMATION - PLAINTIFF	625	
6	COURT'S CHARGE	630	
7	VERDICT	647	
8			
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

				1
\$	36 [1] - 627:8	601:16, 624:12	agree [6] - 608:11,	arise [1] - 636:19
\$10 [1] - 629:3	4	accelerate [2] -	643:1, 643:19,	Aristotle [1] - 628:4
\$250,000 [1] - 630:3	4	596:23, 626:11	644:4, 646:11	arthritic [1] - 614:19
\$300,000 [1] - 630:4	4 [3] - 647:5, 648:13,	- accelerated [1] - 610:13	agreed [3] - 608:19, 615:1, 633:5	aside [1] - 649:12
\$4,000 [1] - 613:6	648:15	accelerating [1] -	ahead [1] - 616:20	assessing [1] - 639:15
\$ 1,000 [1] 0 10.0	41 [1] - 629:8	597:15	aim [1] - 628:4	assistant [1] - 600:13
0	48 [1] - 603:21	acceleration [3] -	al [1] - 604:2	assuming [3] - 620:11, 642:22
		611:20, 612:6,	ALFRED [1] - 591:16	asymptomatic [1] -
08-CV-474 [1] - 591:4	5	618:22	allegations [2] -	626:23
_	5 _[4] - 629:16, 647:13,	access [1] - 604:18	609:25, 610:17	athletic [2] - 627:18,
1	648:16, 648:18	accident [1] - 642:22	alleged [1] - 610:3	627:20
1 [7] - 629:4, 636:8,	5-10 [1] - 618:7	accomplished [1] -	alleges [1] - 635:18	attempt [1] - 618:1
646:1, 646:25,	5-8 [1] - 618:4	642:9	allowed [4] - 593:19,	attention [3] - 592:25,
647:22, 648:5, 648:6	50 [1] - 595:20	according [1] - 644:8	604:23, 604:24	593:17, 617:20
10 [2] - 619:3, 619:13	500 [1] - 591:13	account [3] - 633:17,	almost [3] - 601:11,	attentive [1] - 609:17
100 [1] - 595:20	593 [1] - 650:3	637:6, 639:16	610:2, 623:7	attorney [7] - 602:11,
106 [1] - 591:15	11 - 000.0	accuse [1] - 605:24	alone [3] - 601:24,	604:3, 605:23,
10:28 [1] - 630:10	6	acknowledge [1] -	631:5, 631:12	626:1, 626:6, 626:9,
11501-4404 [1] -		593:20	amazing [1] - 621:21	628:1
591:16	6 [2] - 648:19, 648:21	act [4] - 636:20,	amount [3] - 624:9,	attorneys [7] - 596:20,
11530-2045 [1] -	600 [1] - 591:13	636:22, 636:25,	639:1, 641:4	604:22, 625:14,
591:13	609 [1] - 650:4	638:18	ample [1] - 617:13	625:21, 626:4,
11722 [1] - 591:21	625 [1] - 650:5	acted [3] - 637:23,	analogy [2] - 610:15,	626:8, 630:15
1180 [1] - 591:21	630 [1] - 650:6	638:10, 638:14	611:25	Augustine [1] - 628:8
11:00 [2] - 646:17,	631 [1] - 591:22	action [3] - 630:23,	and-a-half [5] - 624:1,	average [1] - 640:14
647:6	647 [1] - 650:7	631:14, 638:16	624:3, 624:23,	avoid [2] - 628:4,
12 [1] - 627:12	_	actions [1] - 607:3	627:8, 628:25	637:15
12:20 [1] - 647:9	7	activities [1] - 640:4	ANN [1] - 591:17	award [11] - 628:17,
12:25 [1] - 649:18	7 [2] - 648:22, 648:24	activity [2] - 627:18,	announcement [7] -	628:19, 629:13,
13 [1] - 627:12	70 [4] - 601:12,	627:20	618:23, 621:10,	629:20, 639:12,
14 [1] - 592:7	601:17, 602:6,	acts [2] - 606:24,	621:11, 621:13,	639:13, 639:21,
15 [1] - 630:8	629:15	635:12	626:10, 626:14,	639:22, 640:5,
17 [1] - 647:1	712-6108 [1] - 591:22	actuary [1] - 629:9	626:18	640:23, 641:4
18 [1] - 647:2	712-6124 [1] - 591:22	add [1] - 604:6	Announcement [1] -	awarded [2] - 629:16,
		addition [1] - 611:1	618:25	629:18
2	8	adjourned [1] - 649:18	announcements [6] - 619:3, 619:7, 619:8,	aware [2] - 619:7, 620:4
2 [5] - 636:9, 646:1,		admit [1] - 605:13 admits [1] - 607:11	619:13, 619:17,	awareness [1] -
647:2, 648:7, 648:9	80 [3] - 601:12,	admitted [4] - 605:10,	620:8	639:25
2006 [2] - 614:11,	601:18, 602:6	613:24, 616:21,	answer [4] - 599:19,	000.20
614:15		619:11	621:15, 621:20,	В
2007 [1] - 623:9	9	advantage [3] - 602:2,	642:19	
2008 [5] - 614:24,	90 [3] - 629:21, 629:22	602:3, 602:9	apologize [2] -	babes [1] - 606:9
615:9, 623:13,	9:30 [1] - 592:1	advise [1] - 619:8	593:25, 597:10	backflush [4] - 611:7,
623:15, 623:18	9:38 [1] - 603:21	advising [1] - 618:25	appeal [1] - 632:11	611:8, 611:10,
2011 [3] - 614:24,	9:40 [1] - 592:12	affected [1] - 618:13	appear [1] - 616:1	626:16
647:1, 647:3		affecting [1] - 608:23	APPEARANCES [1] -	backflushing [9] -
25 [1] - 592:4	Α	affection [1] - 641:3	591:11	602:4, 619:2, 619:7,
	a m // 504:7	affects [2] - 607:17,	appeared [1] - 631:7	621:9, 621:11,
3	a.m [4] - 591:7,	608:21	applied [1] - 641:6	621:12, 621:14, 621:16, 622:3
3 [5] - 636:10, 646:1,	630:10, 646:17, 647:6	afterthought [1] -	apply [4] - 631:20,	bad [7] - 596:8, 597:2,
647:4, 648:10,	Abbasi [1] - 616:6	618:1	634:3, 634:4, 641:17	597:13, 597:15,
648:12	ability [1] - 640:3	age [1] - 640:10	appreciate [1] - 628:1	626:12, 626:13,
30 [1] - 592:5	able [4] - 592:19,	aggravated [1] -	April [1] - 623:18	628:15
300 [1] - 595:20	601:17, 615:19,	639:21	argue [3] - 597:21,	BADIAK [1] - 591:15
35 [2] - 629:17, 630:5	626:2	aggravation [1] -	603:15, 625:15	balls [1] - 624:2
35.3 [3] - 629:8,	absence [1] - 649:8	639:21	argument [1] - 604:23	bankruptcy [1] -
629:14, 640:13	absolutely [2] -	ago [3] - 607:20,	arguments [2] -	604:11
	, , <u></u>	616:12, 616:13	630:16, 633:8	
	Ī	I	1	I

bar [1] - 616:16 Barboza [1] - 618:2 BARNES [1] - 591:12 base [1] - 598:1 based [4] - 613:8, 615:23, 641:5 basis [1] - 635:1 basketball [2] - 624:1, 624:3 Bay [2] - 600:21, 607:6 beard [1] - 618:6 becomes [1] - 642:11 **bed** [1] - 601:5 **BEFORE** [1] - 591:10 begin [1] - 646:18 beginning [3] -594:17, 624:19, 644:20 **belief** [1] - 632:23 believable [1] - 599:20 bend [1] - 623:25 bending [3] - 623:24, 624:14, 627:14 Bernard [2] - 624:5, 624:9 best [1] - 594:9 bet [1] - 602:17 better [1] - 594:13 between [5] - 602:18, 605:20, 612:8, 631:15, 635:16 beyond [1] - 594:16 bias [5] - 613:23, 621:1, 621:3, 631:20, 633:23 bicycle [1] - 611:25 big [2] - 599:8, 624:9 bing [1] - 622:18 birth [1] - 604:17 bit [1] - 605:7 blatantly [1] - 603:18 blue [1] - 621:2 Blue [1] - 595:8 board [1] - 613:4 boat [19] - 595:25, 596:1, 598:22, 599:2, 599:4, 601:2, 601:3, 601:20, 602:4, 602:6, 602:10, 605:13, 606:8, 606:14, 606:19, 609:2, 621:18, 626:11, 626:16 boats [3] - 622:24, 622:25 body [1] - 608:21 bone [1] - 607:17

books [1] - 611:4

boom [1] - 630:2

booth [1] - 598:18 bootstrap [1] - 615:13 bore [1] - 610:22 boring [1] - 645:10 **bottoms** [1] - 619:16 bouncing [1] - 624:3 boxes [1] - 597:8 boy [1] - 605:25 boys [1] - 600:7 break [1] - 630:8 brief [1] - 641:14 briefly [2] - 612:17, 632:20 bring [2] - 598:9, 598:23 **bringing** [1] - 638:20 brought [12] - 595:5, 604:10, 604:11, 604:13, 605:8, 610:20, 610:21, 610:24, 611:1, 613:4, 616:15, 635:7 burden [4] - 631:23, 631:24, 636:11, 636:13 **bury** [1] - 606:1 business [2] - 623:15, 628:22 **butt** [2] - 598:19, 613:15 buttocks [1] - 601:5 buy [1] - 626:5 BY [2] - 591:14, 591:16

C

C6/7 [1] - 608:20 Caesar [1] - 628:10 calm [1] - 602:4 cannot [1] - 593:2 capable [1] - 618:21 captain [9] - 595:6, 596:23, 597:14, 599:16, 600:16, 610:18, 611:10, 619:2, 619:13 Captain [5] - 601:8, 650:6 601:13, 617:8, 617:10, 617:11 car [4] - 611:25, 616:4 624:16, 627:14 care [8] - 619:14, 636:17, 636:18, 636:25, 637:2, 611:15, 611:17, 637:4, 637:10 613:21, 621:4, carefully [1] - 641:25 622:16 Chris [7] - 600:4, carrying [3] - 623:16, 624:8, 624:14 600:12, 600:17, 602:19, 602:21, case [41] - 594:10,

594:14, 594:16, 597:7, 598:12, 598:20, 598:25, 602:14, 602:16, 604:16, 606:23, 609:25, 612:13, 613:19, 625:16, 625:19. 625:25. 627:6, 630:9, 630:14, 630:17, 630:21, 630:23, 631:2, 631:13, 631:23, 632:24, 633:22, 633:24, 634:1, 635:6, 635:7, 635:13, 636:24, 641:16, 641:20, 641:21, 642:16, 642:22, 649:14 catamaran [1] -611:20 **Catherine** [1] - 607:8 causally [1] - 616:5 caused [5] - 606:14, 609:7, 610:3, 628:18, 639:16 causes [1] - 638:16 **CELLINO** [1] - 591:12 Central [2] - 591:6, 591:21 certain [3] - 622:18, 633:6, 641:9 certainly [1] - 619:14 cetera [2] - 605:20, 605:21 chain [1] - 622:5 chance [1] - 606:10 change [4] - 596:11, 608:5, 642:1, 645:19 changed [5] - 612:18, 613:11. 623:3. 623:4. 629:14 **changing** [1] - 610:9 charge [6] - 627:2, 644:10, 645:3, 645:20, 646:6, 647:5 **CHARGE** [2] - 630:13, **charges** [1] - 639:2 Chernoff [2] - 616:3, chief [1] - 599:14 children [9] - 598:13, 599:3, 599:7, 600:9,

603:1, 603:5 circumstances [6] -636:19, 636:21, 636:23, 637:6, 637:23, 641:7 City [1] - 591:13 civil [2] - 630:21, 631:23 claim [16] - 602:24, 612:6, 613:13, 617:19, 618:21, 629:25, 632:1, 632:11, 632:13, 636:2, 636:4, 636:5, 637:1, 640:18, 640:19, 640:20 claimed [2] - 622:20, 628:22 claiming [2] - 618:11, 618:12 claims [5] - 612:5, 612:17, 631:25, 635:23, 636:14 cleans [1] - 623:2 clear [2] - 610:16, 619:5 clearly [2] - 609:1, 612:7 **CLERK** [2] - 646:8, 646:25 clerk [2] - 642:9, 647:15 client [3] - 604:10, 619:20, 628:2 **Clifford** [1] - 619:6 Clifford's [1] - 620:7 clog [3] - 596:4, 619:5, 621:12 close [3] - 599:15, 599:17, 599:18 **closed** [1] - 599:13 closing [2] - 594:8, 630:16 CM [1] - 591:19 coached [2] - 621:7, 622:16 coaching [1] - 621:15 Coast [3] - 610:11, 612:15, 619:12 coccyx [7] - 600:20, 601:1, 607:4, 607:16, 612:19, 612:22 code [2] - 610:20, 621:2 coffee [3] - 618:14, 625:23, 627:14 collect [1] - 612:14

color[1] - 642:24

Combs [1] - 591:20

coming [1] - 608:20 committed [1] -634:25 common [3] - 596:5, 606:18, 611:8 **commotion** [1] - 618:3 communicate [2] -642:12, 642:15 communication [1] -642:13 community [1] -631:15 companionship [1] -641:3 company [3] - 606:24, 607:2, 611:2 compared [1] - 632:21 comparison [1] -614:24 compensate [2] -639:14, 641:8 complain [1] - 607:22 complained [1] -618:19 complaining [1] -614:11 complaint [4] -599:22, 611:16, 626:3, 626:9 complaints [1] -615:22 completely [2] -596:3, 602:4 **comport** [1] - 610:12 compressed [1] -594:7 computer [1] - 591:25 concerning [2] -631:10, 633:23 concluded [1] -630:16 conclusion [1] -641:13 condition [22] -598:24, 609:2, 614:22, 614:23, 615:2, 615:3, 615:9, 615:10, 615:11, 615:13, 616:8, 620:5, 626:22, 627:1, 627:4, 627:5, 639:19, 639:20, 639:22, 639:23 **conditions** [1] - 620:9 conduct [6] - 619:21, 638:2, 638:4, 638:7, 638:10, 638:14 conflicts [1] - 631:6 confronted [1] -597:23

2

connected [1] - 613:9 Connecticut [1] -635:17 connection [2] -613:12, 614:5 conscientiously [2] -641:6, 644:7 conscious [2] -639:14, 639:24 consider [8] - 594:19, 605:1, 633:9, 633:13, 634:12, 634:17, 639:10, 640:10 consideration [1] -631:18 considered [4] -631:14, 632:21, 633:25, 640:20 considering [2] -634:2, 639:8 consistent [2] -599:21, 601:20 conspiracy [1] -598:15 consulting [1] -596:19 contemporaneous [1] - 613:25 contention [1] -594:21 continue [2] - 622:10, 643:9 continued [1] - 620:14 Continued [1] - 647:7 contract [2] - 626:5, 626:6 contradicted [1] -634:6 contradiction [1] -634:11 control [1] - 604:17 controls [1] - 631:12 convenient [1] - 622:4 conversation [3] -593:20, 594:8, 602:18 conversations [1] -617:13 convince [1] - 604:7 convinced [1] - 642:2 cooks [1] - 623:2 copy [2] - 645:5, 645:7 corporation [1] -635:11 corporations [1] -631:16 correct [2] - 642:2, 644:23 correctly [1] - 644:15

counsel [4] - 610:20, 612:4, 617:10, 631:3 counterclockwise [1] - 610:7 Country [1] - 591:13 counts [1] - 597:10 couple [3] - 614:6, 623:13, 630:2 course [6] - 610:5, 613:5, 614:4, 614:8, 624:7, 624:11 Court [4] - 591:19, 647:4, 647:5, 647:13 COURT [25] - 591:1, 592:8, 592:13, 592:25, 605:3, 605:5, 609:5, 616:17, 622:9, 623:21, 629:12, 630:7, 630:14, 644:15, 644:19, 644:25, 646:10, 646:14, 646:19, 646:22, 647:12, 648:1, 649:3, 649:10, 649:15 court [17] - 593:4, 593:22, 594:1, 598:10, 603:5, 631:13, 631:17, 633:3, 642:6, 642:14, 642:17, 644:9, 644:18, 646:25, 647:2, 648:3, 649:4 COURT'S [2] - 630:13, 650:6 Courthouse [2] -591:5, 591:20 courtroom [2] -633:12, 646:17 COURTROOM [12] -647:16, 647:20, 647:25, 648:2, 648:7. 648:10. 648:13, 648:16, 648:19, 648:22, 648:25, 649:2 covered [1] - 646:3 craft [2] - 611:21, 611:23 craning [1] - 609:21 create [1] - 627:4

credence [1] - 634:19

604:20, 604:21,

617:18, 625:14,

credible [3] - 594:24,

625:21, 626:1

611:11, 628:24

credibility [6] -

credit [1] - 613:21 crew [11] - 595:6, 599:16, 602:22, 602:23, 602:25, 610:18, 610:21, 610:22, 610:24, 616:22, 617:4 crewcut [1] - 618:7 crippled [1] - 627:22 Cross [8] - 606:23, 606:25, 615:3, 620:10, 625:3, 635:9, 635:11, 635:13 cross [3] - 607:23, 633:2, 643:10 CROSS [1] - 591:7 cross-examination [2] - 633:2, 643:10 cross-examined [1] -607:23 CSR [2] - 591:19, 591:20 cue [2] - 621:25, 622:18 D dad [1] - 601:21

dad [1] - 601:21 daily [1] - 640:3 damages [17] -628:17, 628:20, 635:21, 636:10, 638:24, 639:1, 639:2, 639:8,

638:24, 639:1, 639:2, 639:8, 639:10, 639:12, 639:13, 639:15, 639:21, 639:23, 640:6, 640:10, 640:23 **danger**[7] - 619:21, 619:22, 620:2, 620:6, 620:13, 638:1, 638:2 **dangerous** [1] - 609:2 **date** [1] - 591:7 **dated** [2] - 646:25,

647:2 **daughter** [5] - 598:6, 617:1, 617:22, 627:16 **Davis** [1] - 607:9 **days** [12] - 592:6,

601:4, 608:12, 608:13, 608:14, 608:16, 608:17, 614:2, 614:6,

622:23, 627:12 **deal** [1] - 594:8 **dealt** [2] - 626:4,

631:17 December [2] - 623:9, 623:12 decide [7] - 632:25, 633:15, 637:22, 639:4, 639:7, 639:9, 639:11 decided [2] - 592:24, 631:14 deciding [4] - 633:7, 633:13, 634:9, 634:17 decision [2] - 633:16, 642:2 deck [2] - 617:9, 618:16 dedication [1] -593:17 deed [1] - 604:5 deem [1] - 631:8 Defendant [2] - 591:8, 591:15 defendant [32] -593:7, 594:23, 594:25, 595:4, 595:22, 598:16, 602:8, 603:14, 606:22, 606:23, 625:8, 628:18,

631:25, 634:3, 635:9, 635:10, 635:13, 635:15, 635:22, 636:1, 636:8, 636:13, 636:24, 637:1, 637:19, 637:21, 637:22, 639:20, 644:17, 644:20, 647:22, 648:4 defendant's [8] -595:24, 596:20, 601:25, 632:19, 635:19, 635:24, 636:11, 639:17 defendants 151 -602:5, 606:13,

defendants [5] 602:5, 606:13,
631:22, 632:14,
639:6

DEFENSE [2] 609:12, 650:4

defense [2] - 603:12,
604:3

define [2] - 630:20,
638:18

defined [2] - 636:16,

637:25 **defining** [1] - 630:25 **definitions** [1] -636:15

degenerative [3] -

614:21, 626:21, 627:6 degrading [1] - 604:15 degree [5] - 594:23, 594:25, 595:3, 636:17, 637:4 delay [2] - 612:8,

612:11 **deliberations** [7] - 611:21, 630:25, 641:19, 641:23, 642:12, 646:5, 646:18

646:18 **demeaning** [1] -604:15

denied [3] - 592:8, 597:22, 649:15 denies [1] - 635:22

deny [3] - 603:6, 603:17, 603:18

deposition [1] -623:24 depositions [1] -

605:22 **DEPUTY** [12] - 647:16, 647:20, 647:25,

648:2, 648:7, 648:10, 648:13, 648:16, 648:19, 648:22, 648:25,

649:2 **dermatol** [1] - 615:23 **described** [2] - 618:7, 633:20

desire [1] - 642:7 **detail** [2] - 609:10, 634:14

details [8] - 599:25, 600:6, 600:9, 600:11, 605:19, 621:23, 622:17

determine [4] - 635:24, 636:2, 639:1, 640:8 **developed** [1] -

614:20 diagnose [1] - 600:20

die [2] - 628:11, 640:15 different [4] - 596:4,

Dick [1] - 619:24

596:11, 615:18, 634:14

differently [3] -632:13, 634:15, 634:16 dire [1] - 606:12

direct [1] - 633:2 direction [1] - 610:16 disability [3] - 603:24,

4 604:1, 624:6 **Dr** [17] - 607:9, 612:21, 631:8, 631:9, 626:13, 628:2, engagement [1] disbelieve [1] - 634:8 612:24, 613:3, 612:11 631:11, 632:1, 634:22, 634:25, 632:2, 632:4, 632:7, disc [3] - 626:21, 613:24, 614:4, engine [2] - 611:4, 635:4 627:3, 627:6 614:10, 614:17, 612:10 632:8, 632:10, Expert [1] - 611:18 614:21, 615:5, 632:12, 632:14, experts [2] - 598:23, discharged [1] - 649:7 engineer [3] - 595:6, 615:16, 616:3, 610:19, 611:2 632:17, 632:20, 626:21 disclose [1] - 614:12 616:4, 616:6, 616:11 632:21, 632:25, discuss [2] - 609:9, England [7] - 600:4, explain [2] - 636:4, 633:4, 633:6, 633:8, drafted [1] - 626:9 641:21 600:13, 600:17, 636.14 633:12, 633:14, discussion [1] dramatic [1] - 596:24 602:19, 602:21, **extensively** [1] - 594:6 634:1, 634:22, 641:20 draw [2] - 603:10, 603:2, 603:5 extent [2] - 603:15, 634:25, 636:7, 631:7 enjoyment [2] - 640:1, 640:8 disease [1] - 627:6 639:4, 640:11, dropped [1] - 618:14 640:2 extremely [1] - 612:2 disgrace [1] - 622:6 641:5, 641:17, dual [1] - 612:1 ensued [4] - 592:1, disks [2] - 607:5, eye [1] - 618:4 641:20, 644:8, 614:24 due [1] - 635:21 592:11, 647:8, 649:8 eyes [1] - 603:13 645:9, 645:10, **Disney** [1] - 622:23 during [8] - 593:19, entered [2] - 611:22, 645:12, 645:13, 612:4 610:1, 610:5, 611:7, F dispute [1] - 645:11 645:15, 646:7, 611:21, 615:16, entities [1] - 631:16 disregard [1] - 633:11 face [4] - 621:5, 646:15, 646:19, 641:17, 642:11 entitled [10] - 631:18, disregarded [1] -624:10, 628:15, 649.13 631:19, 639:1, duties [1] - 630:20 633:7 628:16 evil [1] - 628:8 639:6, 639:7, 639:9. duty [3] - 631:1, distal [1] - 615:7 fact [7] - 595:5, exacerbate [2] -636:24, 644:6 639:11, 640:9, **distinctive** [1] - 618:5 602:10, 604:11, 627:4, 627:5 640:22, 641:23 distribution [1] -604:12, 604:13, exacerbated [1] epidural [1] - 607:9 615:23 Ε 621:17, 634:13 628:19 equal [4] - 631:13, **DISTRICT** [3] - 591:1, earn [2] - 595:17, factor [1] - 638:20 exact [2] - 638:5 631:15, 631:16, 591:1, 591:10 628:23 factors [2] - 633:17, exaggerating [1] -631:18 District [1] - 591:20 earned [2] - 604:25, 634:17 615:17 equals [1] - 631:17 divorce [1] - 604:14 605:2 facts [11] - 604:17, examination [3] -**ESQ**[3] - 591:14, doctor [5] - 600:25, easier [3] - 598:21, 631:2, 631:3, 615:17, 633:2, 591:16, 591:17 607:15, 607:23, 628:10, 646:2 643:10 631:11, 631:19, **essence** [1] - 613:23 608:15, 608:19 633:1, 633:4, 633:7, easily [1] - 624:16 examined [2] essential [1] - 631:24 Doctor [1] - 608:3 **EASTERN** [1] - 591:1 633:13, 641:7, 607:23, 646:12 establish [1] - 632:1 doctors [5] - 614:19, easy [1] - 598:25 641:16 examples [1] - 603:20 established [1] -616:14, 625:17, failed [2] - 614:10, eat [1] - 623:2 **except** [1] - 642:13 621:6 625:20, 627:9 effect [2] - 632:8, 637:1 excessive [2] - 629:3, et [3] - 605:20, 605:21, documents [1] -638:21 failing [1] - 636:22 629:17 649:12 592:18 fails [1] - 636:12 either [7] - 595:2, exchange [1] - 641:24 evaluate [1] - 635:3 dog [3] - 624:7, 624:8, failure [2] - 636:17, 599:19, 612:1, excluded [1] - 633:10 evenly [1] - 632:17 624:14 637:9 631:21, 632:6, excused [1] - 649:3 event [4] - 602:8, dogs [2] - 623:16 fair [3] - 594:18, 632:18, 642:9 exercise [2] - 637:2, 614:5, 617:16, dollars [3] - 629:3, 594:24, 603:16 election [1] - 611:12 637.9 634:15 629:4, 629:17 fairest [1] - 629:11 elements [4] - 630:23, Exhibit [5] - 646:25, events [1] - 633:19 **Dominick** [1] - 591:19 fall [2] - 598:19, 631:25, 636:6, 641:2 647:2, 647:4, 647:5, eventually [1] - 607:8 DomTursi@email. Ellen [1] - 591:20 611:17 647:13 evidence [73] com [1] - 591:22 embarrassing [1] falsehood [1] - 634:12 **exhibits** [2] - 633:3, 592:17, 592:20, done [4] - 634:6, 618:3 family [3] - 618:16, 645:9 593:6, 594:18, 636:21, 636:23, 618:18, 622:9 embarrassment [3] exist [4] - 614:24, 594:21, 594:22, 637:12 618:8, 618:9 fault [1] - 638:17 615:2, 615:4, 615:9 594:25, 598:2, donut [1] - 623:11 emergency [1] favor [7] - 594:24, expectancy [7] -602:12, 602:13, doubt [1] - 594:17 595:21, 631:19, 617:22 629:8, 640:7, 603:12, 604:22, doughnuts [1] employed [2] -632:16, 632:19, 640:11, 640:12, 604:24, 604:25, 627:15 644:7, 648:4 595:16, 595:17 640:13 605:17, 609:17, **Dowling** [1] - 616:6 favorable [2] - 594:21, employees [2] expected [1] - 635:1 611:22, 612:4, down [15] - 593:23, 594.22 635:12, 635:14 experience [3] -612:21, 612:22, 596:10, 599:5, favorite [1] - 628:13 employer [1] - 595:19 613:8, 634:23, 641:6 612:23, 613:1, 617:4, 617:15, Fax [1] - 591:22 employers [1] - 607:3 expert [14] - 595:24, 615:10, 616:18, 618:12, 619:4, fear [1] - 644:7 end [1] - 594:10 606:15, 607:14, 621:7, 622:20, 620:2, 621:9, February [1] - 623:15 endure [1] - 628:12 607:19, 608:1, 625:3, 625:16, 621:16, 621:18, engaged [2] - 610:6, Federal [1] - 591:21 610:10, 613:4, 625:19, 630:14, 621:19, 622:2, 620:1 619:6, 619:11, feedback [1] - 594:13 631:2, 631:6, 631:7, 625:18, 627:23

	Ī	Ī	ī	
feet [1] - 624:2	645:23, 645:25,	Garden [1] - 591:13	646:21, 646:24,	638:25, 639:3,
fell [7] - 598:24, 600:7,	646:1	gears [1] - 613:13	649:11	639:9, 639:11,
601:5, 611:15,	following [11] - 592:1,	gee [2] - 599:15,	Gridelli [3] - 621:8,	639:18, 640:8,
617:1, 617:14,	592:11, 620:14,	600:10	621:18, 625:11	640:12, 640:18,
618:14	630:11, 633:18,	geeze [1] - 624:23	grimacing [1] - 624:11	640:21
fellow [1] - 641:25	636:6, 644:14,	general [2] - 630:20,	Guard [3] - 610:11,	held [1] - 614:14
felt [2] - 600:10,	644:18, 647:7,	630:24	612:15, 619:12	help [3] - 599:3,
621:24	647:8, 649:8	gentleman [1] -	guess [1] - 595:16	645:24, 646:22
FERRY [1] - 591:7	food [1] - 600:8	599:13	gun [3] - 602:12,	herniated [3] - 607:5,
ferry [11] - 596:12,	fooled [2] - 625:6	gentlemen [9] -	602:16, 616:11	614:23, 627:3
606:7, 610:8,	FOR [4] - 593:11,	593:15, 597:6,	guy [3] - 600:3, 603:9,	herniation [2] - 615:7,
635:15, 635:17,	609:12, 650:3, 650:4	598:17, 599:24,	618:4	615:11
635:20, 637:3,	forelady [1] - 647:17	608:22, 625:12,	GYN [1] - 604:18	heroes [1] - 628:16
637:13, 637:15,	foreperson [2] -	626:15, 629:20,		herself [1] - 599:5
637:17	645:17, 645:24	648:2	H	hesitate [1] - 642:1
Ferry [7] - 606:23,	FOREPERSON [2] -	George [1] - 628:13	ha-ha [1] - 606:17	hesitated [1] - 622:17
606:25, 615:3,	647:19, 647:24	GEORGE [1] - 591:14	half [13] - 597:9,	high [3] - 597:20,
625:3, 635:9, 635:11, 635:14	foresee [2] - 638:9,	Gibson [38] - 593:14,	601:11, 607:20,	597:21, 597:24
few [4] - 614:2,	638:11	598:4, 598:6, 598:7,	608:14, 613:9,	hired [4] - 613:3,
616:12, 617:13	foreseeable [9] - 619:21, 620:2,	598:12, 601:19, 602:1, 602:19,	613:14, 613:16,	613:4, 616:11 hit [3] - 606:8, 610:8,
field [1] - 634:24	620:6, 620:12,	603:24, 604:5,	615:12, 624:1,	643:1
filed [5] - 604:11,	637:6, 637:25,	604:13, 606:4,	624:3, 624:23,	643.1 hitting [1] - 607:16
610:1, 610:2, 610:6,	638:1, 638:5, 638:6	606:7, 608:13,	627:8, 628:25	hold [1] - 619:16
611:16	foreseen [2] - 638:13,	612:13, 616:21,	hallway [1] - 593:23	holding [2] - 624:8,
film [2] - 612:20, 613:2	638:15	623:9, 629:15,	hand [5] - 607:14,	627:14
films [2] - 613:1, 613:7	forget [1] - 634:10	629:24, 635:8,	608:18, 612:24,	honeymoon [1] -
finally [2] - 597:1,	former [2] - 610:10,	635:18, 635:21,	636:22, 638:12	630:1
630:24	618:2	636:3, 636:5,	hands [2] - 619:16,	Honor [11] - 592:3,
fine [2] - 600:22,	forms [1] - 633:1	638:25, 639:4,	624:10	593:10, 603:22,
606:20	forward [3] - 606:21,	639:9, 639:11,	hardest [1] - 627:25	616:16, 622:11,
fingers [1] - 614:9	610:13, 610:15	639:18, 640:12,	head [7] - 593:23,	623:22, 644:24,
finished [1] - 626:15	four [10] - 597:9,	640:17, 640:21,	599:8, 600:10,	646:13, 646:21,
first [12] - 593:7,	604:14, 607:12,	640:22, 641:4, 641:8	618:5, 621:24, 622:5, 624:19	647:13, 649:11
593:16, 606:12,	622:7, 622:8,	GIBSON [2] - 591:3,	heads [2] - 619:1,	HONORABLE [1] -
608:25, 609:5,	622:22, 627:8,	591:4 Gibson's [6] - 611:11,	643:17	591:10
609:24, 612:18,	628:25, 643:23	621:3, 636:1, 637:1,	healing [2] - 612:23,	hope [4] - 594:13,
618:23, 630:2,	fractured [6] - 600:20,	640:8, 640:18	615:10	596:15, 598:7, 626:2
630:19, 635:24,	600:22, 612:21,	giggling [1] - 600:7	hear [7] - 611:12,	hoped [1] - 594:2
645:16 fishing [3] - 623:1,	612:22, 612:25 frankly [1] - 622:6	given [5] - 613:7,	642:7, 642:20,	hopefully [1] - 604:25
627:20	frankly [1] - 622:6 free [4] - 626:24,	620:7, 639:5,	642:21, 643:3,	hospital [2] - 600:19,
five [10] - 592:16,	627:1, 627:7, 649:17	641:18, 644:9	643:18	608:14
597:8, 605:3, 605:5,	Friday [5] - 602:22,	glasses [2] - 618:5,	heard [8] - 595:8,	hours [1] - 622:25 house [2] - 626:5
608:4, 621:22,	602:23, 603:2,	618:7	618:3, 619:24,	hulls [1] - 612:1
623:21, 625:13,	617:20, 617:23	goodness [1] - 604:18	621:20, 633:11,	Hum [1] - 621:23
630:7	front [1] - 609:15	govern [1] - 630:20	643:7, 643:16,	hundred [1] - 623:7
Five [1] - 630:9	functions [1] - 640:3	governs [1] - 630:17	643:19	hundreds [1] - 608:2
flavor [2] - 642:21,	funny [2] - 618:15,	greater [4] - 632:4,	HEATHER [1] - 591:3	hunt [1] - 617:4
643:3	621:10	632:5, 634:19	Heather [30] - 593:14,	hurt [12] - 595:11,
flip [2] - 611:12,	fusion [2] - 607:19,	greatest [1] - 628:8	598:4, 598:12,	599:5, 599:7, 601:6,
611:13	608:20	greet [1] - 593:20	600:9, 602:1,	601:21, 601:24,
flip-flopping [2] -	future [5] - 629:7,	GRIDELLI [17] -	602:19, 606:4,	606:1, 616:25,
611:12, 611:13	630:4, 639:14,	591:14, 592:3,	608:13, 609:19, 609:20, 611:11,	617:3, 617:4, 617:5,
flopping [2] - 611:12,	640:10, 641:10	592:9, 593:10,	612:13, 616:21,	617:15
611:13		593:13, 605:4,	618:16, 618:18,	hurting [1] - 617:21
Florida [1] - 622:23	G	605:6, 609:7,	623:9, 635:8,	husband [2] - 635:8,
fluidly [1] - 624:18	game [1] - 624:1	616:16, 625:12,	635:18, 635:25,	640:18
flush [1] - 621:11	games [1] - 623:3	629:13, 644:16, 644:24, 646:13,	636:5, 636:25,	
follow [4] - 613:6,]	077.27, 0 1 0.10,		
I	1	1	Ī	

		Ī		I -
i	628:1, 628:18,	J	647:18, 648:1,	634:24
'	628:19, 635:19,		649:2, 649:3, 649:9,	least [1] - 599:16
identify [1] - 618:1	637:14, 638:5,	Jadamec [1] - 611:1	649:16	leave [2] - 601:24,
imagination [1] -	638:25, 640:4,	jammed [1] - 617:15	JURY [1] - 649:1	649:17
620:12	640:7, 640:9, 641:12	January [1] - 623:13	justice [3] - 594:20,	leaves [1] - 600:12
immediately [1] -	injury [27] - 600:24,	Jeremy [1] - 618:2	629:21, 629:23	left [7] - 592:16, 605:3,
610:2	601:3, 601:6,	jerks [1] - 637:16		605:5, 618:24,
impending [1] - 619:9	604:16, 607:4,	Jersey [1] - 622:24	K	623:21, 629:12,
implicate [1] - 618:1	608:23, 609:4,	Jessica [2] - 598:5,	14 040 7	646:17
importance [1] - 631:4	609:8, 610:2, 614:1,	601:19	Kamewa [1] - 612:7	legal [2] - 630:22,
important [9] -	614:3, 614:5,	jet [2] - 611:9, 612:8	keep [3] - 605:13,	635:25
595:18, 600:18,	619:21, 627:3,	Jet [3] - 596:9, 610:6,	605:15, 634:9	length [1] - 632:6
604:19, 604:21,	636:1, 637:7, 638:1,	635:16	keeps [1] - 610:9	LEONARD [1] -
605:12, 606:5,	638:4, 638:6, 638:9,	jobs [1] - 604:12	kid [1] - 622:7	591:10
614:22, 625:15,	638:14, 638:18,	Joe [2] - 642:10,	kids [11] - 598:9,	less [2] - 629:18,
634:13	638:19, 638:20,	642:13	599:2, 600:11,	629:21
imposed [1] - 637:10	638:21, 638:23,	jolting [1] - 637:13	617:1, 617:14,	letter [2] - 646:25,
impossible [1] -	639:16	Jonathan [15] -	621:6, 622:7, 622:8,	647:2
611:19	injustice [1] - 629:23	593:14, 603:24,	622:12, 622:13,	level [1] - 639:25
impress [1] - 631:4	innocent [1] - 634:11	603:25, 604:5,	627:19	liability [1] - 637:10
impression [1] -	inspector [1] - 610:11	622:20, 629:14,	kids' [1] - 623:3	liable [5] - 637:13,
605:23	instead [3] - 592:4,	629:24, 635:8,	kind [1] - 598:11	638:24, 644:17,
improper [1] - 620:10	608:3, 637:9	635:21, 636:3,	King [1] - 628:6	644:21, 644:23
inability [1] - 641:10	instruct [3] - 630:17,	640:17, 640:22,	knowledge [1] - 641:6	lie [1] - 598:10
inadequate [2] -	630:22, 631:20	641:4, 641:8	known [1] - 635:15	life [15] - 605:20,
629:6, 629:19	instructions [4] -	JONATHAN [1] -		623:3, 627:7, 629:8,
Inc [2] - 635:9, 635:14	630:18, 630:19,	591:4	L	629:14, 630:1,
incident [11] - 602:8,	636:15, 642:8	judge [11] - 593:13,	lack [2] - 631:9,	640:2, 640:4, 640:7,
603:11, 603:14,	insurer [1] - 637:8	594:17, 597:4,	636:16	640:11, 640:12,
603:17, 608:12,	intelligence [1] -	605:9, 619:19,	ladder [1] - 607:17	640:13
610:18, 615:12,	633:20	629:9, 631:19,	ladies [9] - 593:14,	ligament [2] - 615:7,
616:9, 618:10,	intentional [1] -	641:16, 646:8,	597:5, 598:16,	615:8
623:10, 624:23	634:12	647:16, 649:2	599:24, 608:22,	light [4] - 633:25,
include [1] - 641:19	interacting [1] - 594:3	JUDGE [1] - 591:10	625:12, 626:14,	638:10, 638:15,
includes [1] - 640:1	interest [1] - 633:22	Judge [1] - 594:1	629:20, 648:2	642:24
including [1] - 633:18	interested [1] - 622:9	judge's [1] - 627:2	landed [1] - 598:19	likely [3] - 599:18,
inconsistent [1] -	interpretation [1] -	judges [1] - 631:3	lapse [1] - 634:11	632:3, 632:23
597:5	593:3	judgment [1] - 641:7	large [1] - 611:23	limited [1] - 594:5
indicate [1] - 614:3	interruption [3] -	JUJROR [1] - 592:24	last [2] - 613:3, 613:4	limits [1] - 592:15
indicated [6] - 610:11,	623:4, 623:14,	Julius [1] - 628:10	law [13] - 630:17,	line [4] - 596:7,
612:24, 614:4,	624:13	Juror [7] - 648:5,	631:17, 631:20,	603:10, 613:7,
615:2, 621:3, 640:16 indicia [1] - 599:24	investigator[1] - 619:12	648:7, 648:10,	635:6, 635:7, 639:2,	619:16
indicia [1] - 599:24 individual [1] - 607:2	involved [4] - 598:10,	648:13, 648:16, 648:19, 648:22	639:5, 641:18,	LISA [1] - 591:17
individual [1] - 607:2	616:10, 625:21,	JUROR [7] - 648:6,	645:3, 645:4,	list [5] - 594:15,
606:24	633:24	648:9, 648:12,	645:21, 646:6,	598:22, 606:14,
	involves [1] - 640:2	648:15, 648:18,	646:14	626:17
industry [2] - 595:12, 595:13	irrelevant [1] - 633:10	648:21, 648:24	laws [1] - 610:12	listed [3] - 599:2,
inferences [1] - 631:7	Island [4] - 607:7,	jurors [7] - 592:21,	lawsuit [3] - 610:1,	602:10, 609:2
influence [1] - 606:16	614:2, 616:1, 616:6	593:18, 594:4,	610:3, 640:19	listen [4] - 592:19, 627:2, 641:25, 643:9
inherently [1] - 600.16	Islip [2] - 591:6,	593:16, 594:4, 594:11, 594:18,	lawyer [1] - 594:13	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
initial [1] - 608:23	591:21	630:25, 641:25	lawyers [13] - 592:15,	listened [1] - 594:2 listening [1] - 609:17
injection [2] - 623:17	issue [4] - 594:20,	jury [21] - 591:10,	592:17, 592:19,	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
injections [3] - 607:9,	595:1, 600:23, 616:2	592:1, 592:12,	593:6, 594:11,	listing [1] - 598:3
607:13, 629:1	issues [2] - 615:14,	593:15, 598:7,	616:18, 633:4,	litigation [2] - 597:9,
	644:8	606:12, 624:25,	633:8, 642:25,	610:5
injured [4] - 600:8,	itself [5] - 601:7,	628:1, 628:20,	643:25, 644:11,	live [2] - 629:10,
605:12, 612:19, 625:24	612:20, 613:2,	630:20, 642:15,	644:13, 645:8	640:15
injuries [14] - 603:16,	639:23, 642:19	643:15, 646:17,	leading [1] - 621:19	lives [1] - 623:5
606:11, 609:9,	300.20, 072.10	647:9, 647:12,	learn [1] - 594:12	LLP [1] - 591:15
500.11, 603.3,			learning [2] - 596:1,	Loch [1] - 606:17
Ī	I	I	I	I

624:1, 624:2,

629:12, 630:7

log [2] - 611:4, 611:6 London [2] - 596:10, 635:17 look [9] - 597:8, 598:2, 602:11, 607:14, 613:7, 615:8, 622:8, 624:10, 624:11 looked [3] - 612:20, 612:25, 613:1 looking [4] - 609:21, 612:13, 615:9, 643:17 loss [15] - 622:19, 629:24, 630:4, 635:22, 636:3, 640:1, 640:2, 640:17, 640:19, 640:23, 640:24, 641:1, 641:8 lost [1] - 628:21 love [2] - 594:11, 641:3 loving [1] - 624:7 lower [3] - 613:12, 613:13, 616:2 loyalty [1] - 595:19 luck [1] - 646:16 **lumbar** [1] - 607:5 lunch [3] - 646:4, 649:6, 649:17 lurks [1] - 637:16

М

madam [1] - 647:17 magnitude [1] -618:11 main [4] - 607:21, 607:24, 608:1 **major** [1] - 615:15 man [2] - 596:19, 628:10 manager [2] - 600:13, 619:24 maneuvered [1] -606:19 manned [1] - 612:14 manner [1] - 633:21 manual [4] - 597:19, 597:23, 612:5, 612:7 manufacturer [1] -612:10 Marcus [12] - 612:24, 613:3, 613:24, 614:10, 614:12, 614:17, 614:21, 615:1, 616:12, 616:13, 616:15 Marine [1] - 618:2 marine [2] - 595:13,

massive [2] - 624:5 material [1] - 615:8 matter [4] - 608:15, 614:6, 616:19, 633:24 mean [13] - 603:7, 612:10. 613:11. 618:4, 618:8, 621:5, 623:14, 624:3, 624:5, 624:20, 632:5, 642:18, 645:3 meaning [1] - 609:4 means [8] - 608:14, 626:23, 628:21, 632:2, 632:4, 632:21, 637:4, 639:24 measure [1] - 639:10 mechanical [1] -591:25 mechanically [2] -611:19, 617:17 medical [5] - 612:17, 613:25, 615:23, 617:20, 639:19 medicals [2] - 615:25, 626:20 meeting [1] - 622:1 member [3] - 616:22, 617:5, 642:15 members [6] - 595:6, 599:17, 610:21, 610:22, 610:24, 624:25 memory [2] - 633:21, 634:11 merciless [1] - 628:6 merely [1] - 638:7 merits [1] - 642:16 message [1] - 600:12 might [1] - 595:20 migrated [1] - 613:15 miles [1] - 627:17 million [4] - 629:3, 629:4, 629:16, 629:18 mind [2] - 632:22, 634:10 minds [1] - 632:9 Mineola [1] - 591:16 minimum [1] - 595:18 minute [5] - 623:8,

610:10

600:1

marked [3] - 645:9,

645:15, 647:12

marks [1] - 608:18

604:13, 630:1

Mary [3] - 599:23,

married [3] - 603:23,

minutes [15] - 592:5, 592:16, 603:22, 605:3, 605:5, 619:3, 619:8. 619:13. 619:17. 620:8. 623:21, 625:13, 630:8, 630:9 miss [2] - 644:11, 644:12 missed [1] - 645:6 mistake [1] - 606:20 Moderate [1] - 618:24 mom [5] - 598:8, 601:21, 601:22, 601:24, 617:2 moms [1] - 598:7 Monday [3] - 600:4, 600:5, 602:20 money [1] - 645:18 Monster [1] - 606:17 month [3] - 608:7, 613:3, 613:4 months [7] - 604:14, 607:22, 608:3, 608:4, 608:5, 608:7, 623:13 morning [2] - 592:3, 609.14 most [5] - 604:19, 604:21, 606:5, 626:8, 649:12 mother [6] - 598:11, 599:3, 613:22, 621:5, 621:23 motion [1] - 615:20 **motions** [1] - 649:10 motive [1] - 595:21 mouth [1] - 606:9 move [3] - 606:21, 624:16, 649:12 movement [3] - 619:9, 637:17, 637:20 moving [5] - 615:18, 619:10, 619:18, 624.18 MR [21] - 592:3, 592:9, 593:10, 593:13, 605:4, 605:6, 609:7, 609:14, 616:16, 616:21, 621:1, 622:11, 623:22, 625:12, 629:13, 644:16, 644:24, 646:13, 646:21, 646:24, 649:11 **MRI** [4] - 600:21, 612:20, 614:25,

MRIs [2] - 613:2, 614:25 Mulvehill [1] - 626:8 must [16] - 631:19, 632:11, 632:19, 633:13, 633:15, 634:3, 636:6, 637:9, 637:15, 638:7, 638:17, 638:25, 639:2, 639:12, 642:3, 644:5

Ν name [2] - 600:1, 604:5 nearly [1] - 632:11 necessary [1] - 642:11 neck [10] - 609:21, 613:14, 613:15, 614:1, 614:3, 614:5, 614:18, 615:18, 624:22 need [5] - 592:22, 605:9, 614:5, 624:23, 626:18 negligence [18] -608:25, 609:3, 619:20, 635:20, 635:25, 636:6, 636:8, 636:12, 636:16, 636:19, 637:1. 637:25. 638:8, 638:12, 639:17, 639:20, 640:21 negligent [8] - 597:13, 606:13, 628:18, 636:2, 637:19, 637:21, 638:7, 647:22 nerves [1] - 608:19 Ness [1] - 606:17 never [15] - 595:10, 596:23, 597:17, 597:18, 598:9, 603:6, 612:25, 618:4, 619:25, 627:8, 627:21, numerically [1] -627:22 new [4] - 615:10, NY [1] - 591:6 615:11, 615:13, 622:25 **NEW** [1] - 591:1 New [9] - 591:13, 591:16, 591:21,

596:10, 607:7,

next [3] - 599:23,

629:17, 630:5

625:5, 625:6, 635:16

606:6, 621:17, 621:21 night [19] - 595:7, 596:9, 601:7, 601:9, 601:13, 601:14, 602:22, 602:23, 603:3, 611:2, 611:4, 616:23, 616:24, 617:2, 617:7, 617:21, 617:23 **NO** [7] - 648:6, 648:9, 648:12, 648:15, 648:18, 648:21, 648:24 **nobody** [1] - 618:13 nontreating [1] -613:17 normally [1] - 594:7 notation [2] - 611:5, 611.6 note [9] - 642:9, 642:13, 642:14, 642:18, 642:19, 642:23, 642:25, 644:2, 647:12 notes [5] - 592:21, 593:1, 593:2, 594:6, 645:2 nothing [12] - 595:7, 601:12, 602:25, 611:3, 614:3, 620:3, 623:3, 623:4, 624:21, 626:19, 628:14, 640:14 notice [2] - 620:5, 644:10 notify [3] - 599:10, 599:11, 599:12 November [4] -599:18, 623:10, 647:1, 647:2 number [5] - 592:6, 594:15, 602:24, 632:5, 633:17 Number [1] - 646:25 numbness [1] -608:18

Nicholas [4] - 598:6,

0

644:3

o'clock [1] - 646:4 oath [1] - 644:6 **OB**[1] - 604:18 **OB-GYN** [1] - 604:18 objected [2] - 595:23, 604:2

615:9

objection [1] - 616:16 objections [2] - 594:3, 633:9 objective [1] - 615:23 observations [1] -641.5 observe [1] - 633:19 observed [1] - 609:19 obviously [4] - 602:7, 602:9, 603:1, 644:23 occasionally [1] -637:12 occurred [6] - 596:3. 602:2. 620:12. 630:11, 644:14, 644:18 occurrence [2] -611:9, 638:5 **OF** [2] - 591:1, 591:9 offer [1] - 646:20 offered [1] - 633:14 officer [2] - 595:11, 600:14 officers [1] - 595:9 offices [3] - 599:13, 599:15, 599:17 often [2] - 602:6, 602.7 **old** [1] - 622:24 Old [1] - 591:13 omission [1] - 638:19 once [1] - 641:15 One [1] - 608:7 one [26] - 592:21, 593:25, 594:15, 594:22, 595:16, 596:4. 599:16. 601:18. 602:12. 603:8. 603:9. 607:25, 608:12, 608:13, 608:16, 611:4, 611:5, 613:19, 618:14, 618:19, 625:23, 625:24, 628:14, 629:12, 643:22, 645.18 open [3] - 642:17, 644:9, 644:18 opening [5] - 593:5, 594:5, 601:25, 604:4, 617:25 operates [1] - 635:15 operating [1] - 600:13 operation [2] - 612:7, 637:2 operations [2] - 612:5, 619:24 operative [1] - 615:5 operator [3] - 599:14,

637:13, 637:15 opinion [9] - 607:24, 608:5, 608:10, 613:17, 616:8, 635:2, 641:24, 642:1. 642:2 opinions [2] - 634:21, 634:22 opportunist [2] -603:19, 603:23 opportunity [2] -617:14, 633:19 opposed [2] - 632:12, 632:22 opposite [1] - 632:14 orally [1] - 642:17 order [1] - 619:19 ordinarily [1] - 634:21 ordinary [1] - 636:17 Orient [4] - 599:12, 601:22, 617:7, 635:16 Orthopedist [1] -607:7 Orwell [1] - 628:13 osteophyte [1] -614:20 osteophytes [1] -614:19 otherwise [1] - 601:16 outcome [1] - 633:22 outside [3] - 592:1, 606:16, 633:12 overruled [1] - 616:17 owed [1] - 636:24 owl [1] - 624:20 own [9] - 606:15, 606:20, 611:3, 611:4, 619:6, 622:8, 641:5, 641:24, 642:3 owner [5] - 637:5, 637:8, 638:3, 638:9, 638:13 owns [1] - 635:15

Ρ

p.m [1] - 591:7 pad [1] - 592:23 page [5] - 612:4, 620:14, 637:24, 644:12, 647:7 paid [2] - 613:6, 613:16 pain [21] - 607:10, 607:12, 624:11, 626:25, 627:23, 628:5, 628:7, 628:9, 628:15, 628:16,

628:21, 628:25, 629:5, 629:7, 639:14, 639:24, 640.1 painful [2] - 623:24, 627:1 paint [1] - 604:10 papers [1] - 610:6 paragraph [1] - 644:12 paralyzed [1] - 627:22 parent [1] - 599:4 parking [1] - 624:20 part [8] - 597:3, 608:21. 608:23. 619:20, 632:4, 633:23, 634:8, 640:4 participate [1] - 640:3 particular [4] - 618:11, 634:24, 643:4, 643:13 parties [4] - 630:15, 631:13, 631:15, 631:18 parts [1] - 630:18 party [1] - 631:18 pass [1] - 631:5 passenger [4] -618:13, 635:20, 637:8, 637:14 passengers [5] -596:15, 618:17, 618:25, 619:8, 636:25 passengers' [1] -637:14 past [6] - 628:20, 628:25, 629:5, 629:24, 630:3, 639:14 patience [1] - 628:12 pause [1] - 596:25 pay [1] - 592:25 Peconic [3] - 600:21, 607:6, 614:1 pecuniary [2] -640:23, 641:8 penalized [1] - 643:12 pencil [1] - 592:23 people [4] - 626:22, 629:10, 634:10, 634:14 percent [6] - 623:7, 629:15, 629:21, 629:22, 629:23 perform [2] - 640:3, 641:10 perjury [1] - 603:10

permitted [1] - 640:5 person [10] - 602:20, 606:2, 609:4, 636:18, 636:20, 636:23, 638:22, 640:15, 645:17, 645:19 personal [2] - 604:16, 635:19 persons [2] - 631:16, 644:7 persuaded [2] - 625:1 phony [1] - 615:20 **photo** [1] - 624:7 phrase [1] - 632:7 physical [2] - 628:8, 628:15 physically [2] -611:19, 618:20 physician [1] - 613:17 **physics** [1] - 610:12 pictures [1] - 611:22 piece [2] - 602:12, 602:13 pills [1] - 604:17 pilot [1] - 606:25 pin [1] - 615:3 piped [1] - 621:19 place [1] - 632:12 Plaintiff [1] - 591:12 plaintiff [18] - 593:6, 593:7, 593:9, 596:3, 608:4, 609:23, 622:15, 631:24, 632:15, 635:18, 635:21, 635:25, 636:12, 638:24, 640:1, 640:17, 644:16, 644:22 PLAINTIFF [3] -593:11, 650:3, 650:5 plaintiff's [1] - 627:25 PLAINTIFF/Mr[1] -625:11 plaintiffs [6] - 631:21, 632:10, 632:13, 634:2, 635:8, 648:4 **Plaintiffs** [1] - 591:5 plaintiffs' [2] - 635:23, 636:14 play [1] - 643:5 played [1] - 609:22 playing [2] - 627:15, 627:19 Plaza [1] - 591:21 pleasure [1] - 628:5 **pm** [2] - 647:9, 649:18 Point [5] - 599:12, 601:22, 617:8, 635:16, 646:1

8 point [8] - 595:1, 595:3, 600:23, 602:15, 609:24, 617:10, 625:18, 625:19 points [1] - 615:6 police [2] - 595:9, 595.11 poll [1] - 648:1 **polled** [1] - 649:2 port [1] - 618:24 portion [4] - 635:6, 635:7, 645:4, 645:21 portions [2] - 642:6, 642:7 ports [1] - 596:5 position [2] - 621:4, 634:20 possible [1] - 638:7 precisely [1] - 635:4 preexisting [4] -639:19, 639:20, 639:22, 639:23 prejudice [2] - 631:21, 633:23 preponderance [9] -594:18, 594:24, 632:1, 632:2, 632:3, 632:7, 632:18, 632:20, 636:7 presence [2] - 592:11, 647:8 presented [2] -630:15, 639:5 pretty [1] - 604:7 prevail [1] - 636:5 previous [2] - 627:5 probable [1] - 638:8 problem [6] - 600:20, 614:14, 615:6, 617:5, 620:4, 627:8 problems [2] - 614:11, 614:15 proceed [3] - 606:2, 611:10, 626:15 proceeding [1] -598:10 Proceedings [2] -591:25, 649:18 process [1] - 614:21 produced [1] - 591:25 produces [3] - 603:12, 626:25, 632:22 producing [1] -638:21 proof [8] - 601:3, 605:14, 605:17, 608:22, 612:12, 631:23, 636:11 properly [1] - 612:14

permanency [1] -

permanent [1] - 640:9

640:7

proportion [2] -619:22, 638:2 protect [1] - 608:10 prove [8] - 594:16, 595:2, 602:14, 602:15, 605:15, 628:23, 632:2, 636:6 proved [1] - 632:23 proven [4] - 595:1, 595:3, 609:24, 623:5 proves [1] - 601:7 provide [3] - 636:15, 640:14, 641:11 proving [1] - 631:24 proximate [7] - 609:3. 636:9, 637:24, 638:16, 638:17, 638:18, 638:19 prudent [6] - 636:18, 636:20, 636:22, 637:5, 638:8, 638:13 **pull** [1] - 603:13 pulled [1] - 624:4 pulling [1] - 624:20 puppy [1] - 624:9 put [10] - 592:15, 592:19, 593:23, 594:21, 596:7, 622:13, 632:13, 643:2

Q

qualified [1] - 634:23 quality [2] - 597:25, 632:8 questioning [2] -622:7, 622:12 questions [3] -595:22, 622:17, 633:9 quick [1] - 625:13 quickly [5] - 596:23, 597:15, 626:11, 627:11, 645:17 quite [4] - 602:5, 602:7, 605:6, 622:6 quotes [1] - 628:3

R

range [1] - 615:20 rape [2] - 605:24, 605:25 rational [1] - 641:19 ray [1] - 612:20 reach [2] - 599:4, 644:5 reached [2] - 647:13, 647:18

read [10] - 597:4, 626:5, 626:7, 642:6, 643:1, 643:10, 644:10, 644:15, 644:19, 645:4 reading [4] - 605:22, 643:8, 643:9, 643:12 real [1] - 621:2 realistic [1] - 613:11 realize [1] - 598:8 realized [1] - 613:13 really [4] - 596:16, 596:18, 597:18, reason [9] - 592:5, 601:17, 607:21, 607:24, 641:10, 642:12, 645:3 reasonable [18] -594:17, 609:4, 614:7, 619:14, 630:3, 631:8, 636:18, 636:20, 636:22, 636:24, 637:2, 637:4, 637:5, 637:10, 638:1, 638.8 638.22 639:12 reasonableness [1] -633:24 reasonably [6] -637:23, 638:4, 638:13, 638:14, 639:13, 641:9 reasons [2] - 608:1, 635:1 rebuttal [1] - 593:8 REBUTTAL [2] -625:11, 650:5 recapitulate [1] -632:20 receipt [2] - 605:14, 605:15 receipts [4] - 605:8, 605:9, 605:10, 605:11 received [4] - 633:4, 634:22, 634:24, 648:3 Recess [1] - 592:10 recess [3] - 630:10, 630:11, 647:6 recollection [3] -

597:5, 597:10,

record [1] - 645:12

recorded [1] - 591:25

records [7] - 604:18,

613:8, 613:25,

614:1, 614:12,

631:11

614:14, 618:17 615:6, 616:12, recover [6] - 639:2, 616:22 639:6, 639:8, 639:9, reported [2] - 614:6, 640:9, 640:23 619:25 recreate [1] - 596:2 reporter [2] - 593:4, red [1] - 643:2 642:6 redirect [1] - 643:10 refer [6] - 603:6, reports [2] - 614:25, 609:19, 635:10, 615:1 635:12, 635:17, representing [1] -647:20 632:12 referred [1] - 641:1 request [3] - 592:4, 642:5, 642:8 referring [1] - 635:13 refers [1] - 632:7 requires [1] - 637:25 refused [1] - 625:20 regard [2] - 638:22, resolve [3] - 614:18, 640:10 631:6, 632:19 resolves [1] - 613:19 regarding [1] - 630:19 respect [2] - 609:25, regardless [2] -594:12, 633:3 631:10 rehearsed [1] - 621:8 respectfully [1] related [7] - 607:15, 649:12 607:20, 608:6, 615:12, 615:15, 612:9 responsibilities [1] -616:5, 616:9 relations [1] - 641:4 593:18 relative [1] - 630:23 responsibility [3] -630:16, 631:1, relieve [1] - 607:10 641:16 rely [1] - 626:2 remain [2] - 618:25, responsible [4] -626:17 638:3 remaining [1] - 640:13 result [6] - 635:19, remarks [1] - 594:6 638:6, 638:9, remember [34] -638:14. 639:19. 592:17, 596:7, 641:11 596:22, 596:25, results [1] - 638:3 597:2, 597:6, 599:12, 599:18, return [4] - 596:9, 616:23, 617:12, 600:6, 600:11, 625:7 600:14, 600:17, reveal [1] - 593:2 601:10, 601:13, 601:17, 601:23, review [2] - 615:5, 602:20, 603:4, 646:8 605:8, 605:19, reviewed [5] - 613:2, 606:8, 606:22, 613:24, 614:1, 607:14, 621:22, 614:2, 614:25 621:23, 625:14, 626:11, 629:14, rise [1] - 647:17 629:20, 629:25, 634:14, 634:15, river [1] - 596:10 643:24 Road [1] - 591:13 remembered [2] rock [1] - 606:8 617:11, 621:25 role [1] - 631:5 remembers [3] rolled [1] - 601:5 600:1, 601:9, 617:12 room [1] - 617:22 remind [1] - 641:15 round [1] - 601:11 repeat [1] - 644:5 repeated [2] - 642:5, Roy [2] - 610:10, 642:8 619:12 report [4] - 613:1, rude [1] - 593:23

Reporter [1] - 591:19 resisting [1] - 615:18 response [2] - 612:8, 607:2, 627:4, 627:7, ridiculous [1] - 601:6 risk~[2] - 637:6,~638:4round-trip [1] - 601:11 rule [1] - 643:21 rules [6] - 593:21, 594:1, 594:2, 630:20, 630:24, 639:5 run [1] - 606:11 running [1] - 624:14 runs [1] - 635:16

9

S

safety [2] - 636:25, 637:9 Saint [3] - 624:5, 624:9, 628:8 **sat** [2] - 622:1, 622:16 satisfied [3] - 620:9, 643:7, 643:11 **Saturday** [1] - 617:23 savvy [2] - 625:5 saw [8] - 593:23, 613:25, 614:15, 617:9, 623:9, 624:18 scale [1] - 632:14 scales [2] - 594:20, 632:15 Scognamillo [1] -593:14 SCOGNAMILLO [1] -591:17 Scott [8] - 595:7, 595:24, 596:13, 596:22, 597:11, 610:10, 611:18, 619:12 Scott's [1] - 626:10 scrutiny [1] - 622:14 Sea [4] - 596:8, 610:6, 618:24, 635:16 seamen [1] - 595:12 seat [4] - 599:2, 610:4, 611:17, 626:4 seated [4] - 592:13, 618:25, 626:17, 647:25 seats [1] - 611:16 second [5] - 593:7, 604:21, 618:16, 622:19, 630:22 secondly [1] - 620:6 section [1] - 609:6 secure [2] - 626:17, 628:5 see [13] - 592:22, 597:19, 601:24, 611:13, 611:22, 621:13, 623:23, 623:25, 643:17, 644:11, 645:6,

645:12, 645:25

seeing [1] - 621:3 seek [1] - 617:20 seeks [1] - 635:21 selective [1] - 613:8 sell [1] - 626:5 selling [1] - 623:15 send [11] - 642:12, 642:18, 642:25, 643:2, 643:20, 643:24, 644:2, 645:20, 645:22, 646:4 sending [1] - 645:4 sense [2] - 596:5, 606:18 separate [1] - 640:18 **Service** [1] - 635:9 **SERVICES** [1] - 591:7 services [11] - 622:20, 629:25, 630:4, 635:22, 636:3, 640:17, 640:19, 640:25, 641:2, 641:11 Services [2] - 635:11, 635:14 setting [1] - 608:9 several [1] - 633:1 sexual [2] - 605:20, 641:3 shall [3] - 631:20, 635:10, 639:21 sharply [1] - 597:17 **shaved** [1] - 618:5 sheet [10] - 606:13, 628:20, 645:23, 645:25, 646:9, 646:11, 646:14, 647:4, 647:21 shell [1] - 627:19 ship [16] - 598:18, 599:7, 599:10, 599:11, 601:9, 601:10, 601:14, 605:10, 619:15, 619:18, 625:23, 637:5, 637:8, 638:3, 638:9, 638:13 ships [1] - 596:11 shopping [2] - 623:1, 623:11 shore [1] - 622:24 short [2] - 592:6, 593:7 shortly [4] - 619:5, 619:10, 624:22 shoulder [3] - 614:10, 614:15, 615:15 show [3] - 598:2, 604:1, 618:18

showed [2] - 597:19, 608:17 showing [1] - 611:23 **shown** [1] - 622:21 **shows** [2] - 604:25, 621.7 sic [1] - 612:1 side [9] - 594:22, 594:23, 595:21, 605:1, 612:1, 614:16, 616:16, 632:6, 632:18 sidebar [3] - 644:11, 644:13, 644:14 sides [1] - 632:14 Siena [1] - 607:8 sign [1] - 626:6 significant [1] - 612:8 Silence [1] - 595:9 silence [2] - 610:21, 621:2 simple [2] - 598:23, 621:22 simply [1] - 632:2 Sise [3] - 600:16, 603:8, 619:25 sit [1] - 625:18 sits [1] - 623:6 sitting [3] - 609:20, 616:4, 616:7 situation [1] - 594:19 six [2] - 603:21, 643:22 skip [1] - 605:6 skipped [1] - 622:17 skipping [1] - 637:24 slam [3] - 621:16, 621:19, 622:2 slammed [3] - 618:12, 620:2, 621:9 **slamming** [1] - 599:5 slightly [1] - 632:15 slip [1] - 598:19 slipped [1] - 598:23 slow [1] - 596:12 slowing [2] - 619:4, 637:11 **slowly** [1] - 619:18 **small** [1] - 634:14 **smile** [1] - 624:10 **smoking** [2] - 602:12, 602:16 smoothly [1] - 637:12 **snob** [1] - 593:22 so-called [1] - 616:22 soccer [1] - 627:15 society [4] - 640:25,

641:2, 641:3, 641:11

soda [1] - 598:19

sole [1] - 631:3 solely [2] - 613:18, 634:19 **someone** [1] - 618:2 sometimes [8] -597:6, 634:10, 641:1, 642:18, 642:20, 642:21, 643:3 son [1] - 598:6 sooner [1] - 640:15 sorry [2] - 605:4, 605:6 sought [1] - 632:23 **SOUND** [1] - 591:7 Sound [8] - 606:23, 606:25, 615:3, 620:10, 625:3, 635:9, 635:11, 635:13 **space** [1] - 619:3 **speaking** [4] - 594:2, 615:25, 617:11 speaks [1] - 599:23 specialized [1] -634:24 specifically [4] -601:8, 601:13, 601:17, 614:18 **speculative** [1] - 640:5 speed [5] - 597:20, 597:22, 597:24, 619:5, 619:10 **spilled** [2] - 618:13, 625:23 **spinal** [1] - 607:19 **spine** [7] - 599:8, 600:10, 607:5, 608:24, 617:15, 621:24, 622:3 Spine [4] - 607:7, 614:3, 616:1, 616:6 spot [1] - 624:21 squat [1] - 627:23 squatting [4] - 624:1, 624:2, 624:14, 627:13 **squirming** [1] - 624:9 St [1] - 607:8 stable [4] - 611:21, 611:23, 612:2, 612:14 stand [4] - 609:21, 631:16, 643:22, 644:3 **standards** [1] - 634:3 standing [1] - 631:15 start [2] - 593:5, 646:5 started [1] - 643:4 starting [3] - 628:22,

629:25, 637:11 starts [1] - 607:5 statement [4] -601:25, 606:5, 645:13, 645:14 statements [2] -593:5, 633:8 states [1] - 612:7 **STATES** [2] - 591:1, 591:10 States [1] - 612:14 **statistical** [1] - 640:14 stay [1] - 604:16 steer [1] - 596:2 stenography [1] -591:25 Stephen [2] - 598:6, 628:6 stepped [1] - 598:18 stiff [1] - 624:17 still [7] - 595:16, 600:15, 600:17, 603:5, 603:8, 622:21 stipulated [1] - 633:5 stop [5] - 611:9, 628:14, 637:20, 643:8. 643:11 stopping [1] - 637:11 **stops** [1] - 637:16 store [1] - 623:11 stories [1] - 611:13 story [9] - 598:17, 599:21, 601:19, 610:9, 610:11, 612:18, 613:6, 613:12, 629:1 Street [1] - 591:15 stretch [1] - 620:11 stricken [1] - 633:10 **strong** [1] - 602:13 stuff [1] - 602:24 subject [2] - 622:14, 642:15 submit [6] - 598:2, 604:20, 629:2, 629:5, 629:16, 630:3 submitted [1] - 641:17 **substance** [1] - 602:1 substantial [1] -638:20 sudden [7] - 611:19, 612:6, 612:11, 618:21, 637:15, 637:18, 637:20 **suddenly** [1] - 620:1 suffered [2] - 635:19, 638:25 suffering [8] - 628:21,

628:25, 629:5,

629:7, 639:15,

10 639:24, 639:25, 640.1 suggestion [1] - 639:3 Suite [1] - 591:13 Sultan [7] - 612:21, 613:2, 614:4, 614:17, 614:21, 614:25, 615:16 **Sultan's** [1] - 615:5 sum [2] - 602:1, 604:24 SUMMATION [6] -593:11, 609:12, 625:11, 650:3, 650:4, 650:5 **summation** [1] - 645:2 summations [1] -592:15 sums [1] - 644:6 Sunday [4] - 600:2, 616:24, 617:24 **support** [1] - 613:25 supported [1] -610:17 supports [1] - 632:11 supposed [4] -619:15, 643:21, 643:24, 643:25 surgery [9] - 613:16, 614:4, 614:18, 614:23, 615:15, 616:9. 624:24. 627:10. 629:1 surveillance [1] -627:12 **sustain** [2] - 636:12, 641:9 sustained [2] -640:24, 641:9 switched [2] - 613:13, 616:3 sworn [1] - 633:1 sympathy [2] -631:19, 631:21 **symptom** [2] - 626:24, 627:1 symptom-free [1] -627:1 symptoms [4] -608:11, 615:17, 615:21, 626:23 sympton [1] - 627:7 **system** [3] - 599:14, 602:4, 612:7

Т

table [3] - 600:8, 610:17, 629:9 tables [3] - 640:12,

640:14, 640:16	649:10, 649:15
talks [2] - 602:21,	theory [2] - 595:9,
621:2	598:15
tear [1] - 615:6	therefore [3] - 616:18, 634:12, 634:15
ten [9] - 596:20, 607:22, 608:3,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
608:17, 619:8,	thinking [2] - 596:25, 597:12
619:17, 620:8,	Third [1] - 591:15
622:23, 629:23	third [2] - 602:20,
term [1] - 595:8	630:24
terminated [1] -	Thomas [6] - 601:8,
604:12	601:13, 617:8,
test [1] - 596:6	617:11, 619:2
testified [14] - 595:25,	three [22] - 595:6,
596:21, 598:4,	607:12, 607:13,
608:1, 611:18,	607:20, 608:7,
613:21, 614:17,	608:14, 613:9,
614:20, 614:22,	613:14, 613:16,
615:16, 616:8,	615:12, 616:2,
619:6, 621:4, 621:17 testify [9] - 595:10,	619:2, 619:3, 619:7, 619:13, 619:16,
616:5, 616:14,	620:8, 624:23,
616:15, 625:17,	627:17, 630:18,
625:18, 625:20,	636:6, 643:23
634:15	three-and-a-half [4] -
testifying [1] - 633:21	607:20, 608:14,
testimony [25] - 597:3,	613:14, 613:16
597:25, 598:1,	threw [1] - 599:2
611:11, 611:15,	throughout [1] -
620:7, 625:24,	609:20
625:25, 626:11,	thrown [6] - 610:3,
633:1, 633:9,	610:14, 611:14,
633:15, 633:16, 633:25, 634:2,	626:3
634:5, 634:7, 634:8,	tie [1] - 622:4 tie-in [1] - 622:4
634:18, 635:3,	tilt [2] - 594:15, 626:17
635:4, 642:4,	tilted [1] - 601:20
642:21, 642:22,	tilting [1] - 598:3
643:6	tingling [6] - 607:13,
tests [1] - 615:19	608:19, 614:8,
THE [43] - 591:10,	614:11, 614:16,
592:8, 592:13,	615:14
592:25, 605:3,	tinglings [1] - 614:9
605:5, 609:5,	tip [3] - 595:5, 597:17,
616:17, 622:9, 623:21, 629:12,	632:15
630:7, 630:13,	tipped [1] - 596:17
630:14, 644:15,	tips [3] - 594:23,
644:19, 644:25,	594:25, 595:2 title [2] - 600:14,
646:8, 646:10,	634:20
646:14, 646:19,	today [2] - 603:6,
646:22, 646:25,	616:4
647:12, 647:16,	together [7] - 592:20,
647:19, 647:20,	622:22, 623:1,
647:24, 647:25,	645:9, 646:6,
648:1, 648:2, 648:7,	646:21, 646:23
648:10, 648:13, 648:16, 648:19,	took [1] - 632:12
648:22, 648:25,	tos [1] - 649:12
649:1, 649:2, 649:3,	totality [1] - 637:23
,	touching [1] - 642:16

649:10, 649:15	tr
theory [2] - 595:9,	T
598:15	4
therefore [3] - 616:18, 634:12, 634:15	tr tr
thinking [2] - 596:25,	tr
597:12	-
Third [1] - 591:15	tr
third [2] - 602:20,	tr
630:24	
Thomas [6] - 601:8,	tr
601:13, 617:8, 617:11, 619:2	4
three [22] - 595:6,	tr
607:12, 607:13,	т
607:20, 608:7,	tr
608:14, 613:9,	
613:14, 613:16,	
615:12, 616:2,	
619:2, 619:3, 619:7,	
619:13, 619:16,	tr
620:8, 624:23,	
627:17, 630:18,	
636:6, 643:23	tr
three-and-a-half [4] - 607:20, 608:14,	tr
613:14, 613:16	
threw [1] - 599:2	
throughout [1] -	tr
609:20	
thrown [6] - 610:3,	tr
610:14, 611:14,	
626:3	tr
tie [1] - 622:4	tr
tie-in [1] - 622:4	tr
tilt [2] - 594:15, 626:17	
tilted [1] - 601:20	tr
tilting [1] - 598:3	
tingling [6] - 607:13,	tr
608:19, 614:8, 614:11, 614:16,	
615:14	
tinglings [1] - 614:9	
tip [3] - 595:5, 597:17,	tı
632:15	
tipped [1] - 596:17	tı
tips [3] - 594:23,	Т
594:25, 595:2	t۱
title [2] - 600:14,	t۱
634:20	
today [2] - 603:6,	
616:4	
together [7] - 592:20,	
622:22, 623:1,	
645:9, 646:6, 646:21, 646:23	
took [1] - 632:12	4.
tos [1] - 649:12	ty
1 1 11 007 00	

```
raining [1] - 634:23
RANSCRIPT [1] -
591.9
ranscript [1] - 591:25
rap [1] - 608:9
rauma [2] - 600:25,
626:25
raumatic [1] - 614:5
reated [3] - 616:1,
625:17, 629:1
reating [2] - 607:6,
627:9
reats [5] - 607:6,
607:7, 607:8, 607:9
TRIAL [1] - 591:9
rial [9] - 593:19,
602:11, 604:19,
609:16, 609:20,
610:1, 621:4,
627:25, 641:17
ried [5] - 596:1,
596:14, 596:16,
599:12, 599:22
ries [1] - 602:11
rip [7] - 596:9,
601:11, 616:22,
616:23, 617:2,
617:4, 617:13
rips [2] - 601:12,
601:18
rue [2] - 595:12,
605:11
ruly [1] - 644:8
rust [2] - 605:1, 605:2
ruthfulness [1] -
599:25
ry [5] - 599:3, 606:1,
606:2, 644:8
rying [8] - 602:1,
602:9, 603:13,
604:10, 615:2,
615:13, 615:20,
628:23
urn [2] - 610:7,
621:18
urning [1] - 624:19
'ursi [1] - 591:19
welve [1] - 646:4
wo [14] - 600:6,
601:4, 603:4,
604:12, 605:20,
606:3, 606:6,
608:12, 608:13,
608:16, 609:3,
614:25, 619:22,
645:18
ype [7] - 594:8,
594:19, 596:6,
```

types [1] - 615:19 tyrant [1] - 628:6

U

ultimately [1] - 637:22 unable [1] - 632:18 unanimous [3] -643:14, 643:15, 644:6 unanimously [1] -644:3 unbelievable [1] -599:20 uncomfortable [2] -622:7, 622:12 under [5] - 636:19, 636:21, 636:23, 637:5, 637:23 United [1] - 612:14 **UNITED** [2] - 591:1, 591:10 Universal [1] - 622:24 unless [3] - 613:20, 622:15, 644:3 unlimited [1] - 624:8 unreasonable [2] -619:22, 638:2 unreasonably [1] -638:10 unsafe [1] - 598:24 unusual [5] - 611:5, 611:6, 637:16, 637:18, 637:20 unwitnessed [1] -622:15 **up** [20] - 598:16, 598:17, 604:24, 606:20, 607:17, 609:5, 610:13, 611:24, 613:15, 615:20, 618:12, 619:5, 619:10, 620:1, 621:18, 622:4, 622:13, 627:24, 644:6 **US** [3] - 591:5, 591:20, 618:2 usual [2] - 623:4, 623:15

٧

vacations [1] - 622:22 veer [1] - 597:17 **VERDICT** [2] - 647:11, 650:7 verdict [28] - 598:1, 625:7, 628:20, 629:3, 629:4,

639:12, 644:4,

11 644:5, 645:23, 645:25, 646:9, 646:11, 646:14, 647:4, 647:14, 647:15, 647:18, 647:21, 648:3, 648:5, 648:8, 648:11. 648:14. 648:17, 648:20, 648:23, 649:13 verdicts [1] - 594:12 vessel [18] - 594:15, 595:5, 595:25, 596:16, 596:17, 597:16, 605:17, 610:13, 611:20, 611:24, 612:9, 612:15, 618:12, 618:20, 618:24, 619:4, 619:9, 620:1 vessel's [1] - 611:6 victim [3] - 605:24, 606:2, 606:4 video [8] - 624:4, 627:11, 627:12, 627:15, 627:16, 627:17, 627:18, 627:19 videos [11] - 609:18, 609:22, 623:5, 623:8, 623:9, 623:18, 623:23, 624:15, 624:18, 625:1, 625:2 videotapes [1] -623:12 views [1] - 641:24 violent [3] - 637:16, 637:18, 637:20 visit [1] - 601:21 voir [1] - 606:12 volunteer [1] - 628:11 vote [2] - 645:19

W

votes [1] - 645:18

voyage [1] - 602:2

wage [1] - 595:18 wages [1] - 628:21 waited [3] - 597:1 walk [1] - 619:15 walked [1] - 593:24 walking [7] - 617:9, 622:23, 623:14, 623:16, 627:13, 627:16, 627:21 Wall [1] - 595:9 warranted [1] - 631:8 watching [1] - 609:18

597:25, 620:5,

627:17, 627:20

watchman [1] - 617:7 wool [1] - 603:13 water [5] - 598:19, word [5] - 597:12, 606:14, 611:25, 597:13, 621:9, 619:1, 620:1 621:12, 621:14 wave [1] - 610:8 words [6] - 613:19, 619:11, 621:9, weakness [1] - 614:16 weather [1] - 606:15 621:16, 622:18, weekend [1] - 601:11 641:21 weeks [3] - 607:12, works [3] - 600:15, 603:5, 603:9 616:12 weigh [2] - 635:3, world [1] - 628:15 World [1] - 622:23 635:4 worn [1] - 618:4 weighs [1] - 632:17 weight [5] - 631:5, wow [3] - 601:9, 632:8, 634:18, 621:24, 623:10 writing [3] - 642:14, 634:19, 649:13 642:16, 642:19 Wexler [2] - 593:13, wrote [1] - 642:23 594:1 **WEXLER** [1] - 591:10 X whole [5] - 598:15, 599:14, 617:16, **x-ray** [1] - 612:20 627:7, 629:1 wife [1] - 640:20 Y wife's [4] - 635:22, 636:3, 640:24, year [3] - 601:11, 641:10 611:12, 616:3 WILL [7] - 591:15, year-and-a-half [1] -591:16, 609:14, 601:11 616:21, 621:1, years [21] - 596:20, 622:11, 623:22 597:8, 597:9, William [2] - 600:2, 605:15, 607:20, 600:3 613:9, 613:14, willing [1] - 628:11 613:16, 614:20, win [3] - 602:14, 615:12, 616:2, 625:19, 632:10 622:22, 624:23, winter [1] - 599:18 627:9, 628:25, wise [1] - 628:4 629:8, 629:14, wish [3] - 628:14, 629:17, 630:2, 642:4, 642:7 630:5, 640:13 witness [15] - 603:4, yesterday [1] - 592:14 608:1, 609:21, **YORK** [1] - 591:1 633:22, 633:23, York [5] - 591:13, 634:4, 634:6, 634:9, 591:16, 591:21, 634:19, 634:25, 607:7, 635:16 635:4, 635:5, Yorkers [2] - 625:5, 642:23, 643:4, 643:5 625:6 witness' [2] - 633:25, yourself [1] - 626:18 634:8 yourselves [1] witness's [4] - 633:19, 641:22 633:20, 633:21, 634:5 witnesses [13] -592:7, 592:18, 602:5, 603:8, 604:20, 606:6, 613:20, 615:25, 632:5, 633:2, 634:7, 634:21, 634:23

woman [2] - 600:1, 624:6

12